January 8, 2023

Memorandum

To: Dr. Zhongbo YU, Editor of Hydrology and Earth System Sciences

Subject: Revision of Paper # hess-2023-229

Dear Editor:

Upon your recommendation, we have carefully revised Paper # hess-2023-229 entitled “Technical note: Wellbore water volume computation of tracer test in numerical modelling in a confined aquifer”.

Response to Reviewer 1:

My comments are as follows:

1. The proposed new mathematical model is valuable and can be considered as a technical note (after a major revision!)

Reply: Thanks a lot. We have made reversion considering all comments by reviewers.

2. The writing of the paper is very poor, not only in the language but also in the logic and organization. The entire paper must be rewritten.

Reply: We have rewritten the manuscript. English speaker, Dr. Hafizou Mohammed Sow, helped us for checking the English

3. The motivation must be rewritten. The problem in the previous study should be clearly stated and its potential error should be quantified.

Reply: The motivation has been rewritten.

4. The paper may be too long for a technical note.

Reply: We have deleted the discussions.

5. The bottom line is that it is very difficult to review the paper and judge its merit because it is poorly written with a lot of confusing sentences.

Reply: We have revised it.
If you have any further questions about this revision, please contact me.

Sincerely Yours,

Quanrong Wang, PhD, PG.

Professor and

Holder of Endowed CUG Scholar in Hydrogeology