Hydrology and
Earth System
Sciences

Discussions

Open Access

EGU

HESSD

Interactive
comment

Interactive comment on "CABra: a novel large-sample dataset for Brazilian catchments" *by* André Almagro et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 22 January 2021

This study has collected, synthesized, organized, and made available more than 100 topography, climate, streamflow, groundwater, soil, geology, land-use/land cover, and hydrological disturbance attributes for 735 catchments in Brazil. The dataset is valuable for many hydrological and other relevant scientific studies. However, this paper does not provide any in-depth/innovative scientific analysis based on the established dataset. It looks more like a dataset paper rather than a scientific research paper. I would like to recommend a rejection in HESS but would like to suggest a transfer to the journals focusing on data such as Earth System Science Data, Scientific Data - Nature, etc. More specific comments are as follows: 1) Some attributes are from first-hand investigation data (e.g., streamflow, meteorology, geology, catchment delineation, etc.), and a lot of attributes are extracted from global re-analysis dataset. The

former attributes owe higher accuracy and are really valuable for the community to do a variety of hydrometeorological modeling and assessment. The latter attributes are also useful to reduce other uses' time consumption to re-prepare them. But I would like to suggest providing the delineated catchment-based digital map and/or tabular dataset. The spatially distributed dataset is important for distributed modeling. 2) For groundwater attribute: spatial variation of groundwater table is subject to complicated driving factors. Fan et al.'s (2013) can be useful for a regional scale analysis for pattern recognition but would have a lot of uncertainties at catchment scale. The observed well observation dataset would be more useful for such a large-sample catchment dataset effort. 3) Typos to be checked: L44, than? L301 the all the year? L303 be showed seen?

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2020-521, 2020.