

Interactive comment on “Seasonally varied hillslope and groundwater contributions to streamflow in a glacial till and fractured sedimentary bedrock dominated Rocky Mountain watershed” by Sheena A. Spencer et al.

Bettina Schaefli (Editor)

bettina.schaefli@giub.unibe.ch

Received and published: 14 May 2020

This reviewer is very critical about the scientific (added) value of the paper and recommends rejection in the formal reviewer report.

This overall assessment is motivated by the statement that

"the manuscript fails to describe in a robust, quantitative, and convincing way how water moves through this landscape in response to both rainfall and snowmelt.". This statement is motivated by two main critics:

C1

"i) the focus on catchment resilience and disturbance, that do not appear to be logically linked to the paper investigations carried out and sounds out of context;

ii) the presence of hydrochemical data only: despite the powerful nature of hydrochemistry as hydrological tracer, the combination of tracer data and hydrometric data can help to unravel the complexity of hydrological processes at the catchment scales."

The authors' response to the second point does not contain any detailed plans at this stage. I am waiting for a third editor report but I already invite the authors to provide a more detailed plan on how you plan to address the above second point before I can give a recommendation on the submission of a revised version.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2020-105>, 2020.

C2