

Interactive comment on “How rainfall event characteristics affect the applicability of I_{30} as an index of intense or erosive rainfall: a brief review with proposed new rainfall index” by David L. Dunkerley et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 15 April 2019

This manuscript dealt with the issues associated with rainfall index of the wettest 30-minute interval within a rainfall event, I_{30} , as an erosive rainfall and proposed new rainfall index, a nominated fraction of the event duration, such as ED_5 or the wettest 5% of the event duration.

The reviewer was interested in the idea of new index, ED_x , and found the clear explanation about the differences in the values of I_{30} , ED_1 and ED_5 for various patterns of rainfall event.

C1

Unfortunately, however, the reviewer could not find clear explanation about the applicability of ED_x as an index of soil erosion, for example, due to the lack of the analysis of correlation between ED_x and soil erosion. It would be more attractive paper for wide range of readers if the author could state the perspective in the future study about the applicability of ED_x in the conclusion section.

Furthermore, some corrections noted in the PDF should be improved before accepted.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/hess-2019-99/hess-2019-99-RC3-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2019-99>, 2019.

C2