Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2019-407-RC2, 2019 © Author(s) 2019. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Interactive comment on "The millennium old hydrogeology textbook "The Extraction of Hidden Waters" by the Persian mathematician and engineer Abubakr Mohammad Karaji (c. 953–c. 1029)" by Behzad Ataie-Ashtiani and Craig T. Simmons

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 1 November 2019

L21-22: the texts ØğØÍÙĹØÍÚľØś ÙĚØ∎ÙĚØf ØÍÙĘ ØğÙĎØ∎ØşÙĘ ØğÙĎÚľØśØňÛŇ-ØğÙĘØÍØgØů ØğÙĎÙĚÛŇØğÙĞ ØğÙĎØőÙĄÛŇÙĞ are Arabic and not Persian L54-55: the phrase "Instead of Europe" is redundant. I suggest to neglect this phrase. L74: what is the reference for this sentence" Karaji returned to his homeland wrote the book". Please mention the evidence related to this allegation. L254: The authors are requested to develop the idea that claims "the book is the first book on engineering construction management". It needs more proofs and analysis

C.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2019-407, 2019.