Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss.,
https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2019-347-RC4, 2019

Hydrology and Earth System Sciences
Discussions

Interactive comment on "Evaluation of Low Impact Development and Nature-Based Solutions for stormwater management: a fully distributed modelling approach" *by* Yangzi Qiu et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 13 September 2019

The manuscript tries to answer the question regarding the effect of nature-based solutions and low impact development. The manuscript use of English is not sufficient and the flow and structure of the sentences and paragraphs make it very harder to truly review this manuscript. Moreover, I see neither scientific merit nor engineering merit in this manuscript. I cannot even assess the quality of this manuscript as a technical memorandum.

There are a lot to be mentioned for this manuscript.

1- Uncertainty of the model, the simulations, model structure, X-band radar, downscaling etc etc. . . the values and ratio, how can 0.1 cms change be really evaluated given

the total discharge.

2- Validity of the model

3- Feasibility of the nature-based low impact study (it is feasible to have so much change in this region. . . how much does it cost?!)

4- Clear research question/real engineering purpose and problem-solving.

5- Context is missing. Lots of work done on water sensitive cities from years ago. Also, similar works have been done using X-band radar (at least I know of Rotterdam and I am sure it should be more cases around the world).

6- Where is the novelty of this work? and what did I learn when reading this work? I have done work on LID myself so I am familiar with the development but this work is not really adding to what I knew...

Unfortunately, I think the manuscript is not suitable for HESS from presentation point of view, engineering point of view and scientific point of view.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2019-347, 2019.