

Interactive comment on “Technical note: the caRamel R package for Automatic Calibration by Evolutionary Multi Objective Algorithm” by Céline Monteil et al.

Elena Toth (Editor)

elena.toth@unibo.it

Received and published: 29 July 2019

Dear Authors, as I anticipated in the submission phase, I have two main suggestions:

- 1) adding a comparison not only with NSGA-II, but also with the other optimization model you merge in the Caramel (MEAS), since you are proposing an algorithm that should be an improvement above each one of the previous approaches.
- 2) the algorithm, in terms of hydrological modelling, is only tested on a single catchment (and in addition, the details of such application are lacking): in order to prove the generality of the improvement allowed by the proposed approach, you should test the

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



calibration of at least another study catchment.

On the abstract/introduction phrasing: p. 1, l. 13: “caRamel()” why the parentheses? p. 1, l “The comparison with another well-known optimizer (i.e. NSGA-II) confirms the quality of the algorithm” p. 2, ll. 7-14: I would replace with: “CaRamel was initially developed and used for the calibration of hydrological models: Le Moine et al., 2015, Rothfuss et al., 2012, Magand et al., 2014, Monteil et al., 2015 (previously to the R-package release) and Rouhier et al. (2017). The interesting performances of caRamel algorithm in such studies prompted us to describe in detail the algorithm in the present paper, and in particular its use as an R-package, that can be used for any model in the R environment. The user has simply to define a vector-valued function (at least 2 objectives) for the model to calibrate and lower and upper bounds for the calibrated parameters. This paper aims at describing the principles of caRamel algorithm and its use as an R-package, through the analysis of its results when used for the parameterisation of an hydrological model . A comparison with the widely used NSGA-II algorithm (available in the R package, "Multiple Criteria Optimization" MCO, Mersmann et al., 2014), is also presented.”

Elena Toth

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2019-259>, 2019.

HESSD

Interactive
comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

