

Editor decision for manuscript hess-2018-68

A review of the (Revised) Universal Soil Loss Equation (R/USLE): with a view to increasing its global applicability and improving soil loss estimates'

by R. Benavidez et al.

Dear Authors,

I have read the referee's comments and your related replies. In general your replies are satisfactory, so please revise your manuscript accordingly and provide both a version with and without track changes.

Please let me emphasize that I agree with the referees that in order to make the manuscript acceptable as a review paper, the following aspects should be considered:

- A critical discussion/evaluation of the R/USLE applications presented in the paper. Have they been applied according to the recommendations, are output uncertainties honestly discussed, etc.
- R/USLE should be put into the greater context of available Soil Loss Models (which models are out there, how do they differ with respect to underlying concepts/simplifications/assumptions, when to use which, data requirements and output quality)
- A critical and honest discussion of R/USLE output quality / predictive uncertainty through comparison with observations and/or other models. I know that related observations are sparse, but this makes collection and comparison even more valuable for a review paper.
- Recommendations on the application of R/USLE, not only but also with respect to spatial resolution (minimum resolution, recommended resolution, effect of resolution on uncertainty)

Some clarifications of comments by referee #2

- P2 / L6: The key issue here is the word 'transport': Many soil loss models do not explicitly include transport simulations, they just provide erosion rates. So you may want to replace 'by helping understand sediment transport ..' with 'by helping predict erosion rates'
- P6 / L19: The values for summer, winter etc. are independent, so why connect the values from the different studies with lines? Either show as multi-bar plot, or display in a table only.

Yours sincerely,
Uwe Ehret