

François Chabaux
Laboratoire d'Hydrologie et de Géochimie de Strasbourg
Université de Strasbourg-CNRS
1 rue Blessig - 67084 Strasbourg Cedex – France
fchabaux@unistra.fr

2020, February 12th

Pr. Jan Seibert
Handling Editor – Hydrology and Earth System Sciences (HESS)

Dear Editor,

The new revised version of the manuscript we have submitted for publication to HESS (Manuscript HESS-2018-609) has been uploaded with this file.

Please find below the answers to the reviewer comments along with a marked-up manuscript version showing the changes made.

We hope that the new version sent with the letter and the different answers to the reviewer's comments make the manuscript suitable for publication in HESS.

Yours Sincerely

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'F. Chabaux', with a long horizontal stroke extending to the left.

François Chabaux, on behalf of the authors.

Reply to Reviewers – Third round of revisions

Reviewer 1:

The authors have comprehensively addressed previous comments. In particular, the manuscript has been improved with more precise language about novelty of the work, in-depth discussion on concentrations, rates, and transit time, and the positioning of this work in the context of other existing work. I support the publication of the manuscript.

Reviewer 2:

General Summary: This study presents the application of a coupled hydrological—reactive transport model capable of characterizing monthly to annual scale hydrogeochemical variability in Strengbach, a small granitic headwater catchment in France. The model proposed is composed of both a depth-integrated and spatially-distributed NIHM hydrologic model and a Kinetic Reaction and Mass Transport KIRMAT reactive transport model. Although there are several combined hydrologic + geochemical models that have been developed in the literature, this particular model has some unique features that make it quite appealing in application to watershed scales. One feature in particular is the low-dimensional approach to the hydrologic model, which consists mainly of combining vadose and saturated zones into a single subsurface compartment that can be modeled as a simple 2-D layer. Reducing the “dimension” of the hydrologic model has significant advantages in that it reduces the complexity of solving numerically for both unsaturated and saturated flow and the computational costs. This is not the first study to take such an approach, but it is novel in that it’s one of the first studies to combine this “non-dimensionalized” hydrologic model with a fully realized reactive transport model. This model was further validated with field data where independently constrained water transit times through the hydrological simulations were used to accurately predict observed geochemical variability.

General Comments: This last round of revisions has shown large improvements to the overall quality of the manuscript and I thank the authors for their efforts. In light of the corrections that have been made by the authors, I believe that this article is now suitable for publication granted that certain minor modifications are made beforehand. I suggest the authors try to concentrate more on what these model simulations tell us about the catchment dynamics in Strengbach and how this build on findings from other studies of this catchment. As one of the other reviewers noted, Strengbach is a

well-studied catchment and, thus, articulating how the results from these novel hydrological + reactive transport models provides a (large?) step forward in our understanding of the Strengbach catchment in particular would boost the impact of this paper in my opinion. While I think it is good to explore what these findings might mean at a global scale or in comparison to other similar catchments, it shouldn't be the centerpiece of the present conclusions; rather it should be used as motivation for conducting similar types of studies in other catchments in the future.

We updated the section 6.2 discussing the implications of this work for the Strengbach watershed in particular (lines 641-689). More information is available on how our results propose a new step to validate several hypotheses made by previous studies conducted in the Strengbach watershed (i.e. Viville et al., 2012; Pierret et al., 2014; 2018; Pan et al., 2015; Ackerer et al., 2016; 2018; Chabaux et al., 2017; Weill et al., 2017). The modeling work first emphasizes the key role of times of water-rock interactions (lines 647-661). The modeling work also reveals that the spatial distribution of the weathering processes is relatively homogenous within the catchment (lines 662-672). This latter point explains the previous observations of similar chemical fluxes in the stream, springs and regolith profiles (lines 669-673). In addition, our results bring the important conclusion that the hydrogeochemical functioning of the watershed is properly simulated by water circulations in the very shallow subsurface (saprolitic aquifer, lines 674-689). The contribution of waters circulating in the deep fracture network of the granitic bedrock is not necessary to explain both the dynamic of the stream and the chemical composition of springs (lines 674-689). The independent flow paths feeding the springs are also confirming hypotheses from previous isotopic studies (lines 683-689). Finally, section 6.2 underlines how this study improves the understanding of the Strengbach headwater catchment.

However, we believe that it is important for the conclusion of the manuscript not being too much "Strengbach centered", with the meaning that many headwater catchments could behave as we show. This incline us to let room in the conclusions for general implications that our study suggests (lines 787-807).

Additionally, I found quite a bit of spelling and grammar mistakes as I was reading through this latest version of the manuscript. There are also areas where I still believe the writing can be paired down. I strongly urge the authors to address these issues before publication.

We corrected the last mistakes and reduced slightly the text where it was feasible (e.g., section 6.2). Some repetitions between sections regarding "Results" and "Discussions" have been removed (e.g., between sections 6.2 and 4.2, lines 712-724).

Specific Comments:

Lines 36- 37: “explains why transit times span much narrower ranges of variation than that water discharges.” Does this statement apply to Strengbach specifically or is this a more general observation? Please provide citations for the latter.

This finding is a result from our modeling work and is specific to the Strengbach watershed. This is clarified in line 40. The point is that flow over the catchment is mainly controlled by gravity (the slopes) irrespective of the local pressure head gradients. As an example, 1 or 7 m of water-saturated thickness (and therefore of pressure head) in the system does not really influence water velocity when the elevation gradient is of 30%. This renders water velocities almost invariant over time, with pressure heads simply being an indicator of stored water. Water storage highly fluctuates, with consequences on volumetric fluxes and on instantaneous stream discharges, when water velocity fluctuations are smooth.

Line 50: remove “the” in “ effects of the ongoing climatic changes...”

Done line 52.

Lines 87- 89: How the flow is treated in a dimensionally reduced hydrologic model should be quickly added here. Even the explanation that was provided to one of my comments in the last round of revisions is suitable as shown below:

“NIHM solves subsurface flow via an integrated Richards equation ...”

We added this information in the text lines 91-94.

Lines 607-610: Is the model able to track the areas of maximal clay formation in the catchment and how this varies between wet and dry seasons? This would be very useful information to complement the predicted areas of max dissolution rates proposed by the model.

Yes, the model is able to track the clay formation rates and the clay compositions along the flow lines. Clay formation rates are slightly higher at the upstream tips of the flow lines, where the dissolution rates of primary minerals are also higher. With the seasonal variability of the extend of flow lines (flow lines extending up to the crests during wet periods and retracting to middle elevations during dry periods), the clay formation rates are maximal near the crests during floods but maximal at middle elevations during dry periods. We added this information lines 469-475. We moved this part dealing with primary mineral dissolution and clay formation rates in the section on results (lines 469-475), as this result is a direct conclusion of the modeling task.

697-699: Yes, but only on a monthly to annual timescale resolution. It would be interesting to see if this model can replicate observed water chemistry in more high frequency daily or hourly geochemical datasets during major flooding events.

Yes, the modeling exercise in this work is definitely dealing with monthly timescale data, even

though hydrological simulations, due to the variability of rainfalls events, infiltration and stream flow velocities sometimes use very short time steps (sometimes less than 15 min). Testing our modeling approach with high frequency geochemical data would be an interesting new step for the future. But this exercise is currently infeasible because hourly collected geochemical data for the Strengbach spring waters are lacking.

Line 713: Be specific in regard to the explanation of this thermodynamic equilibrium, which is (I think) the primary mineral dissolution reaction. I think I found this elsewhere throughout the manuscript.

We underline here the difference between the chemical equilibrium state of the water as in the sentence: "It is also important to emphasize that the simulated chemical compositions of waters remain far from a state of chemical equilibrium with respect to primary minerals." (lines 756-757), and the way to handle precipitation of clay minerals in the KIRMAT code as in "a clay solid solution precipitated at the thermodynamic equilibrium is able to generate reliable water chemistry (this study) and realistic clay precipitation rates (more detail in Ackerer et al., 2018)" (lines 765-768).

The precipitation of a clay solid solution at thermodynamic equilibrium means that no kinetic data are used for the clay solid solution end members. Only the thermodynamic constants $\log(K_i)$, $\log(Q_i/K_i)$ are used for the precipitation of the clay solid solution end members (supplementary table EA13).

With these model properties, spring waters remain far from a state of chemical equilibrium with respect to primary minerals, resulting however in correctly captured geochemical composition of spring waters (lines 765-768). The overall clay precipitation rates are also realistic compared with the determination of clay mass fractions in regolith samples (lines 765-768, details in Ackerer et al., 2018).

Lines 727-729: "...spatial and temporal variability in flow paths is a key process to explain C—Q relations" I would add for this particular catchment.

We added "in this type of headwater catchment" in line 783. Our results support that this finding is probably applicable for other headwater catchments in a similar context.

Lines 748-752: "...good estimate of the reactive surface within the natural environment" is a little too broad. While I agree that this geometric approximation of the minerals is most likely a better approach in the models, I don't think you can generalize these conclusions to the "natural environment". In this case, for this particular catchment, these estimated low surface areas along with the rate constants did provide good replications of the observed geochemical data. This might

also be the case for other similar granitic headwater catchments, but not perhaps the case for volcanic or karstic systems.

We agree, “natural environment” is a probably a too large perspective. We replaced “natural environment” by “in this type of granitic catchment” to be more specific (lines 805).

Figure 8: The axes for the H_4SiO_4 , Na^+ , K^+ , and Mg^{2+} should really be shown here in mmol L^{-1} , rather than mol L^{-1} that way it’s easier for the reader to see the variability.

All our figures are using mol/L , making that we prefer to keep the axes in mol/L for consistency. But we updated the variation ranges of the axes to improve readability (figure 8).

Reviewer 3:

This work is of great interest and provides new insights in coupling hydrological and geochemical processes at watershed scale. The authors explore the development of a dimensionally-reduced model coupled with a reactive transport model. The modelling approach is validated by field data collected in springs and piezometers at wet and dry periods, which allows for the investigation of the spatial and temporal variability of transit times and reaction rates. The authors conclude on a hydrological control on the chemostatic behavior of the watershed, due to fairly constant transit times despite highly varying flow dynamics. The conclusions of the paper thus strongly rely on the hydrological model simulating a low variability of water transit times, from which the geochemical model logically simulate a low variability of geochemical concentrations. To my point of view, a more detailed description of the hydrological model is needed to strengthen the confidence in the results (see specific comments). I recommend moderate revisions before publication of this interesting work, mainly because information is missing in the method section and because the study would gain from a more detailed analysis of the results.

We updated this new version of the manuscript and we provide more details on the hydrological modeling (section 3.1). In particular, the way the depth-averaged hydraulic conductivity is calculated is detailed in lines 267-273. We also remind that the topic of the present work is not aimed at hydrological modeling with low-dimensional approaches, and that specific publications dealing with the features and the development of the hydrological model NIHM are quoted in lines 202-204 (i.e., Pan et al., 2015; Weill et al., 2017; Jeannot et al., 2018). We reorganized parts of the manuscript to slightly reduce the text when feasible, and we moved a few parts from the section devoted to discussion to the section on raw results for clarity (lines 712-724, section 6.2 to 4.2). A deeper interpretation of the implications associated with our main findings concerning the Strengbach catchment is also proposed in lines 641-689.

Specific comments:

Figure 1. Please add a x scale.

Done in figure 1.

I. 175 refer to Figure 1

We refer to figure 1 line 185.

METHODS

I.179 A lot of geochemical data seem available, both for springs and piezometers, but only some of them are used to validate the models. Why are you only using some of the available data? The model would be improved with a validation on all available data that span a long period of time. And if not, the authors should justify why they use only a limited part of their dataset and how they chose the data used.

The overall geochemical database for springs and piezometers is available in supplementary tables EA1-EA9, and the modeled samples are given in table 1. The caption of table 1 has been updated to clarify that the table only reports on samples used for the NIHM-KIRMAT modeling task. It is not possible to run the NIHM-KIRMAT coupled approach on the overall and vast geochemical database (see supplementary table EA1-EA9) because of computation time (hundreds of samples). In addition, trying to exploit the whole database, would probably blur the message conveyed by this study and stating that a reliable but parsimonious geochemical modeling can rely upon a loose coupling with a hydrological model via streamlines and water transit time distributions. It can also be argued that the geochemical database, started 30 years ago, as most long-term databases started monitoring things without prior knowledge on how the monitored system was working! The authors of the present contribution sorted the data according to their revisited interpretation of the catchment.

That being said, for each date, 10 flow lines are backtracked per site by the code NIHM. After this step, a significant number of KIRMAT runs are performed to generate the mean water chemistry delivered by each flow lines. This approach is possible for a reasonable number of interesting dates and samples, not for all the database including hundreds of samples. Rather than modeling all the samples, we selected a reasonable number of dates that are covering the whole range of hydrological conditions in the catchment (table 1).

I.200 “The exchange of water between the surface and subsurface flows are addressed via the hydraulic head differences between the compartments.” A hydraulic conductivity value of the interface between the two compartments must be also considered. Which value was used? Was it calibrated or fixed? Please clarify.

It has been clarified in line 209-213 that water exchange between the surface (streams) and the subsurface compartments depends both on the thickness and the hydraulic conductivity of the interface layer. This interface layer has the classical physical meaning of riverbed layers that are not the aquifer on the one hand, and not the free flowing water of the river on the other hand.

The hydraulic conductivity of the interface has been calibrated. The feature has been added in the form of values reported in table 2 and mentioned in the text in line 214-226.

The model parametrization paragraph needs clarification and additional precisions.

- “several zones of heterogeneity” please refer to the Figure

Done in lines 220-221.

- Please specify all parameters instead of “other parameters” l.206 for clarity

Done in lines 223-226.

- I guess the aquifer thicknesses given Fig. 2 correspond to the values obtained after the calibration. If so, please be specific on the figure or in the legend. Also add in the legend that the grey lines show the mesh grid of the hydrological model (if it is the case).

Done in figure 2 caption.

- The hydraulic conductivity is calculated using with the Van Genuchten model (which involves parameters such as the saturated hydraulic conductivity, n and α), and therefore is a result of the simulations at the grid size, is it correct? I don't think it is clearly said in the paper.

It has been emphasized in lines 391-396 that the hydraulic conductivity is calculated in NIHM (thus, at the so-called grid-size, by relying upon the empirical Van Genuchten equation to define the effective conductivity compared with its saturated upper bound).

As the temporal variability of the hydraulic conductivity is an important point of this study, I think a very clear explanation of how the depth-integrated hydraulic conductivity is calculated would make it easier for the reader to follow the logic. Fig.6, do the red colour (highest hydraulic conductivity) correspond to the value of the calibrated saturated hydraulic conductivity? If yes, it might be worth saying it, as it shows that the subsurface compartment is fully saturated at high flows.

A short explanation regarding the inference of the depth-integrated hydraulic conductivity has been added in lines 267-273.

The red color in figure 6 indicates that the depth-integrated hydraulic conductivity is higher than $6.1E-5$, while the saturated hydraulic conductivity of most of the catchment is $8E-05$. This also means

that areas at 6.1 E-5 are saturated over almost the whole local thickness of the aquifer. This has been specified in the main text when discussing Fig.6 (lines 400-403).

- How is the calibration realized? Which algorithm was used? Could the authors add some uncertainty estimates on the calibrated parameters?

More precisely, the procedure relied upon a simple Monte-Carlo approach (detailed lines 214-2328) testing various configurations of the system because automatic inversions for integrated hydrological models are not available for the moment (though some advertisements are available in the literature, but not followed by effective inversions exercises). NIHM is in the process of being associated with adjoint-state calculations to perform automatic inversions via descent-direction methods and multi-scale parameterization. A task not straightforward at all when catchments react very differently to subsurface flow, surface routing and diffuse runoff according to their geometrical, geological, topographical and meteorological settings. After multiple exploratory calculations, it was shown that the most sensitive parameters were the depth of the substratum, the saturated hydraulic conductivity, and the porosity. This is why these are the only parameters that were not defined as uniform values over the catchment. Uncertainty estimates on model parameters are unavailable, or more precisely, would be flawed by the Monte-Carlo approach. Each solution does not converge the same way, and bounds on parameters mix models that have not been conditioned the same way. Getting estimates of parameter uncertainties via Monte Carlo approaches would require converging algorithms as for example Monte Carlo Markov Chains (MCMC). Unfortunately, these algorithms applied to a complex system would also require more than 100,000 direct simulations for being statistically meaningful, something infeasible for the moment.

- The hydrological model over the whole catchment is calibrated only on the discharge time series located at the outlet of the catchment. Do the authors have other hydraulic data they could use to strengthen their calibration, such as piezometric heads or spring discharge rates? If not, I am worried that equifinality might not be negligible, which also points for a serious estimation of parameter uncertainties and/or sensitivity analysis (see previous comment).

There are no other continuous discharge rate measurements at the catchment for the simulated period (period which goes with that of available geochemical data on outcropping springs), but there are some boreholes. Unfortunately, these boreholes have been drilled deep enough (60 m) to intercept a few fractures in the bedrock (under the substratum of the shallow subsurface aquifer, made of soil plus saprolitic rock, simulated by NIHM). This renders the water levels monitored in these open boreholes unable to reflect hydraulic pressure heads in the active shallow porous aquifer of the catchment simulated by NIHM. This has been emphasized in lines 274-289. Geochemical

investigations also show that deep borehole waters are not connected with effective subsurface flows feeding the springs and streams (Chabaux et al., 2017; Pierret et al., 2018).

Equifinality is the curse of any modeler, irrespective of the mass of data to condition the model. In some cases, increasing the mass of data can also favor equifinality. In the present case, flow over the system is mainly constrained by the steep slopes (i.e., elevation gradients) of the catchment, thus rendering the water saturated thickness mainly as an indicator of storage and not of water velocity (via pressure head gradients). There obviously exist equifinalities in the model proposed, but they hardly affect water velocities which are very similar for various model configurations, provided those configurations generate transient water storage compatible with the good fitting of the stream flow rate. We are now in the process of completing the third round of review, with more than 6 different reviewers involved, and 18 months past initial submission! We did not stay arms down during that period and tried to improve the hydrological conditioning by introducing local MRS (magnetic resonance sounding) data. Those are sensitive to the vertical distribution of water contents in the subsurface. Introducing these data slightly modified model outputs mainly on the storage capacity distribution (porosity of active aquifer layers) but did not change the transit and residence time distributions and their weak variability over time. A paper has been published on the topic (Weill et al., 2019, *Water* 2019, 11(12), 2637; <https://doi.org/10.3390/w11122637>), but we ignore whether or not we can mention it, as it was proposed and accepted after submission of the present work. That being said, a few words have been added in the manuscript to better emphasize the feature that transit times (which are here the main hydrological output for geochemical modeling) are mainly conditioned by the steep slopes of the catchment (lines 274-289). The paper in *Water* is also quoted (line 761, but can be removed on request). A conditioning on MRS data (Weill et al., 2019, water content distribution) slightly modified the model but without incidence on the overall distribution of flow paths, their variability, and the associated transit time distributions. This is more precisely emphasized in lines 274-289 but can be removed on request.

The hydrogeochemical modelling strategy presented Figure 5 deserves more details. For each flow line, how much is “several”? What is the value of the “constant distance along the flow line” that is used?

We used a constant space step of 1m along the flow lines. This distance refers to the distance between regularly distributed inlets along a stream line where the soil solutions percolate into the aquifer. This information is given lines 333-335. ‘Several’ therefore refers to a variable number of simulations, as this number is specific to each flow line. For example, a flow line with a length of 100 m is discretized into 100 cells of 1 m. 100 KIRMAT simulations will be performed along the flow line

as illustrated in figure 5. The integrated chemistry of waters at the sources is the arithmetic mean of all the solute concentrations given by the 100 KIRMAT runs.

Do the boxes drawn Figure 5 correspond to the grid of the NIHM model or not?

No, the boxes in Fig. 5 represent the grids of the reactive-transport code KIRMAT. But 1D simulations with KIRMAT are performed along the flow lines previously determined by the hydrological model NIHM (lines 327-329). We updated the captions of figures to make this all clear.

KIRMAT simulations were performed for different flow lines independently and then mixed at the outlet of the flow lines, if I got it correctly (Figure 5). The mixing could also occur all along the flow line, each percolated soil water mixing with the water coming from the upstream “box”. Would the results be different?

Both types of mixing are employed, a mixing of water chemistry simulated at the outlet of independent flow lines (as the consequence of diverse flow paths feeding the outcropping sources) and a mixing as presented in Fig. 5. The latter states that along a single flow line, water chemistry is the mix of water that entered the subsurface system (i.e., the flow line) at various points upstream. Because each flow line is associated with a 1m space step injection locations, one can consider that the whole process corresponds to percolations along the whole flow line. The point is that the water flux entering at each location along the flow line is unknown. Calculating at the outlet of the line an arithmetic mean is equivalent to state that percolation of soil water is uniform along the line. This assumption is supported by the modeling results but also by observations of similar geochemical fluxes from stream, springs and regolith profiles (lines 662-673, Viville et al., 2012; Ackerer et al., 2016; 2018).

What is the justification for no mixing between flow lines within the subsurface compartment?

With the physics of Darcian flow in continuous media, the stream lines cannot intersect. Mixing of solutes between lines could only occur by diffusion, which is undoubtedly less efficient in an advection-dominated problem than the spreading generated by taking means of ten independent stream lines (and which could also correspond to solute spreading due to heterogeneous velocities and flow paths).

RESULTS

I. 320 Where are the results of the water velocities?

Results of the mean water velocities are presented figures 7A, 7B, 10A, 10B, 11A and 11B. We also describe these results in section 4.2.

I. 328 Please specify which characteristics of the flow lines you consider similar (geometric

characteristic? length, position...), as the velocity along the flow lines for instance differ from given dates (4.2). Maybe not talking about water velocity along flow lines in this paragraph might be less confusing.

We detailed that for the sites located on linear or slightly convex slopes, all the characteristics (geometry, flow rates, transit times) of the different flow lines that feed each site are comparable for a given site and for a given date (lines 378-380).

I. 341 “or parameters” Parameters should not change under transient conditions as they have been previously calibrated, right?

Yes, we removed ‘or parameters’ because this expression was confusing. We mean here: hydraulic variables (lines 392).

I. 344 Please describe the driving factors of the spatial and temporal change in the simulated hydraulic conductivity. How much is this result related to the geometry of the watershed (small thickness, steep topography...)?

This point is detailed lines 416-429. Spatial variability of the saturated hydraulic conductivity is associated with zones of various thicknesses (some degree of alteration in the saprolitic aquifer) and that fact that low storage capacity, no contributive zones, and rapid draining downward are conducive to dry crests with smaller effective conductivities. Variations over time are mainly associated with the water content in the system. With NIHM calculating effective mean conductivity values over the aquifer thickness, temporal variations of the effective conductivity depend on both hydro-meteorological forcing and the geometry (mainly the thickness) of the aquifer layer.

I. 385 refer to Figure 7

Done line 452.

Figure 7. Where do the uncertainty bars come from in the KIRMAT simulated concentrations? Please, clarify what you mean by “induced” in the legend. A priori it could not be induced by the hydrological model as uncertainties are not taken into account. Is it only coming from the propagation of soil solution uncertainties?

Yes, the uncertainty bars take into account the propagation in the KIRMAT simulations of analytical uncertainties from pH and chemical concentrations measured in the soil solutions. This is now clarified in the figure captions.

Figure 8. The CS1 geochemistry was simulated at 6 different dates, but we cannot tell which of the observation blue point corresponds to each simulated orange point on the Figure. This information is

needed to assess the reliability of the modelling. Maybe using different colors, please link each simulated point to the corresponding observation point.

The figure 8 is already relatively heavy and we avoided to overload it with additional color codes. Instead, we added in the caption of table 1 the information relative to the different dates used for the hydrogeochemical modeling. In the caption of figure 8, we refer now to Table 1 for the dates, chemical data and water discharges of the modeled samples. We also refer in the caption to the supplementary material EA1 for the overall geochemical data. A visual comparison between simulated and measured concentrations is also available in figures 7C, 7D, 10C, 10D, 12A, 12B and 13.

Figure 9. and l. 403-405. The sentence is quite vague. The authors chose to present the differences between elements in a figure, which is very interesting. But then their explanation for the differences remain very vague and not specific to any element. Could the authors expand on the geochemical mechanisms yielding to the different C-MTT relations?

This point is clearly detailed in the discussion section in lines 725-746.

PZ3 and PZ5 piezometers. You already specify paragraph 4.2 that, such as for CS1 and CS3 springs, single flow lines can be used, so you can shorten the first part of the section. Maybe this section could be merged with the previous one as the approach and the results are similar.

We slightly reduced the text in the section 4.2.

CS2 and CS4 springs. Same comment as above, you can probably shorten the justification of the scattered flow line distributions as it is a repetition of paragraph 4.1.

We also slightly reduced the text in this part.

DISCUSSION

Have the standard kinetic constants used here been determined on minerals all coming from the Strengbach catchment? Then would you recommend to use site-specific kinetic constants to account for local aging effects?

No, the standard kinetic constants are coming from studies dealing with minerals from various origins (see table EA12 in supplementary material and references therein, lines 299-300). All these minerals are from natural rocks and were collected in the field, but are not from the Strengbach catchment. Simulations performed with these kinetic constants are able to capture spring chemistry while respecting water transit times, this is why we conclude that relevant aging effects are potentially included in these kinetic constants (lines 628-632).

I am not sure if Figure 13 brings anything new. It might be more interesting to show the distribution of dissolution rates over the catchment.

The figure 13 simply brings a general overview of modeled concentrations along an elevation transect PZ5, PZ3 and CS1 in the watershed. It is not possible to show the distribution of dissolution rates over the catchment, precisely because dissolution rates in our parsimonious geochemical modeling approach are only determined along the backtracked flow lines reaching the sampled sites. That being said, these sites are representative of the various flow patterns over the system, and their variability over time.

The discussion on the chemostatic behaviour would gain from a more concise and straightforward argumentation. Some repetitions with the result section could be avoided. For instance, the whole paragraph describing changes in the simulated hydraulic conductivities, in water velocities and in mean transit times should not be detailed as much or details should be moved to the result section 4.2.

Yes, we reduced slightly the text in this section (lines 712-724). We reduced the discussion section dealing with the general chemostatic behavior and moved some text and examples in the results section 4.2.

Lines 693-699 aim to justify the modelling approach and results (same holds true for the discussion on the clay solid solution), which could be moved elsewhere for clarity. I would advise to refocus the whole paragraph only on the discussion on the potential origins for the chemostatic behaviour.

Here, we underline that the choice of the clay solid solution and the question of the distance to chemical equilibrium for waters are key points in discussing the origin of the chemostatic behavior (see the discussion section 6.2 in Ackerer et al., 2018). The choice of clay minerals and the way to handle clay precipitation is major regarding the acquisition of the water chemistry (see discussion in Godderis et al., 2006; Maher et al., 2009; Ackerer et al., 2018 for example). Clay minerals and clay precipitation rates play a role in controlling whether or not chemical equilibrium occurs along the flow lines, and thus, if chemostatic behavior is explained by chemical equilibrium or not. This is why highlighting the relevance of our clay mineral assemblage and clay precipitation rates is important in this section concerning the chemostatic behavior (lines 763-768). It is worth noting that, within another round of reviews, one of the reviewers asked us to be very picky regarding the two points mentioned above.

References:

- Goddéris, Y., François, L. M., Probst, A., Schott, J., Moncoulon, D., Labat, D., & Viville, D. (2006). Modelling weathering processes at the catchment scale: The WITCH numerical model. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 70(5), 1128-1147.
- Maher, K., Steefel, C. I., White, A. F., & Stonestrom, D. A. (2009). The role of reaction affinity and secondary minerals in regulating chemical weathering rates at the Santa Cruz Soil Chronosequence, California. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 73(10), 2804-2831.

1 **Crossing hydrological and geochemical modeling to understand the spatiotemporal**
2 **variability of water chemistry in a headwater catchment (Strengbach, France)**

3 Julien Ackerer, Benjamin Jeannot, Frederick Delay, Sylvain Weill, Yann Lucas, Bertrand Fritz,
4 Daniel Viville, François Chabaux

5 Laboratoire d'Hydrologie et de Géochimie de Strasbourg, Université de Strasbourg, CNRS,
6 ENGEES, 1 rue Blessig, 67084 Strasbourg Cedex, France

7
8 *Corresponding authors:

9 Julien Ackerer (julien.ackerer@orange.fr), Benjamin Jeannot (bjeannot.pro@gmail.com),
10 Frederick Delay (fdelay@unistra.fr), François Chabaux (fchabaux@unistra.fr)

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22 **Abstract**

23 Understanding the variability of the chemical composition of surface waters is a major issue
24 for the scientific community. To date, the study of concentration-discharge relations has been
25 intensively used to assess the spatiotemporal variability of the water chemistry at watershed
26 scales. However, the lack of independent estimations of the water transit times within
27 catchments limits the ability to model and predict the water chemistry with only geochemical
28 approaches. In this study, a dimensionally reduced hydrological model coupling surface flow
29 with subsurface flow (i.e., the Normally Integrated Hydrological Model, NIHM) has been used
30 to constrain the distribution of the flow lines in a headwater catchment (Strengbach
31 watershed, France). Then, hydrogeochemical simulations with the code KIRMAT (i.e., Kinetic
32 Reaction and MAss Transport) are performed to calculate the evolution of the water chemistry
33 along the flow lines. Concentrations of dissolved silica (H_4SiO_4) and in basic cations (Na^+ , K^+ ,
34 Mg^{2+} , and Ca^{2+}) in the spring and piezometer waters are correctly reproduced with a simple
35 integration along the flow lines. The seasonal variability of hydraulic conductivities along the
36 slopes is a key process to understand the dynamic of flow lines and the changes of water
37 transit times in the watershed. The covariation between flow velocities and active lengths of
38 flow lines over changing hydrological conditions reduces the variability of water transit times
39 and explains why transit times span much narrower variation ranges than the water
40 discharges **in the Strengbach catchment**. These findings demonstrate that the general
41 chemostatic behavior of the water chemistry is a direct consequence of the strong
42 hydrological control of the water transit times within the catchment. Our results also show
43 that a better knowledge of the concentration-mean transit time relations (C-MTT relations) is
44 an interesting new step to understand the diversity of C-Q shapes for chemical elements. The
45 good matching between the measured and modeled concentrations while respecting the

46 water-rock interaction times provided by the hydrological simulations also shows that it is
47 possible to capture the chemical composition of waters using simply determined reactive
48 surfaces and experimental kinetic constants. The results of our simulations also strengthen
49 the idea that the low surfaces calculated from the geometrical shapes of primary minerals are
50 a good estimate of the reactive surfaces within the environment.

51 **1- Introduction**

52 Understanding the effects of **ongoing climatic changes** on the environment is a major issue for
53 the coming years. The global increase of temperature is expected to affect the hydrological
54 cycle at a large scale, and providing a precise estimation of its repercussion on the evolution
55 of soils and on the chemistry of waters remains difficult. This challenge results from the wide
56 diversity of hydrological, geochemical, and biological processes, and of their coupling, that
57 operate at the Earth's surface (e.g., Gislason et al., 2009; Godd ris et al., 2013; Beaulieu et al.,
58 2012; 2016). Up today, the study of concentration-discharge relations (C-Q relations) has been
59 intensively used to assess the coupling between hydrological and geochemical processes at
60 the hillslope or watershed scales (Godsey et al., 2009; Kim et al., 2017; Ameli et al., 2017;
61 Diamond and Cohen, 2018).

62 C-Q relations are acknowledged to integrate critical zone structure, the hydrological dynamics
63 and the geochemical processes of watersheds (Chorover et al., 2017). Recent studies debated
64 to which extend the chemical variability of waters is explained by a mixing of different water
65 sources (Zhi et al., 2019), the chemical contrasts between deep and shallow waters (Kim et
66 al., 2017), the variability of transit times (Ackerer et al., 2018) and/or seasonally variable flow
67 paths (Herndon et al., 2018). It is clear that a good knowledge of the water flow paths and of
68 their seasonal variability is an important new step to better constrain the water transit times

69 within catchments, and then, to correctly understand the temporal fluctuations of the
70 composition of waters. Modeling such variability of water flow paths and water geochemical
71 composition would require further development of modeling approaches able to combine
72 hydrological and geochemical processes (e.g. Steefel et al., 2005; Kirchner, 2006).

73 Recent efforts in hydrological modeling were conducted to develop spatially distributed
74 approaches that better consider the interplay between surface and subsurface processes (e.g.,
75 Gunduz and Aral, 2005; Kampf and Burges, 2007; Camporese et al., 2010). Due to the
76 complexity of flows in the hydrological processes, many modeling approaches are based on
77 the full resolution of Richard's and Saint Venant equations to correctly describe the
78 interactions between stream, overland and subsurface waters (Kampf and Burges, 2007).
79 These approaches have shown their ability to capture the hydrological functioning of various
80 watersheds, knowing that the full resolution of Richard's and Saint Venant equations requires
81 long computational times and faces calibration and parameterization difficulties (Ebel and
82 Loague, 2006; Mirus et al., 2011). Questions have been raised regarding the optimal
83 complexity of the equations that are needed to correctly treat the hydrology of catchments in
84 their surface and subsurface compartments with reasonable computation times (Gunduz and
85 Aral, 2005).

86 Low-dimensional models have attracted growing interest because they represent an
87 interesting compromise between equation complexity, computational time, and result
88 accuracy (Pan et al., 2015; Hazenberg et al., 2016; Weill et al., 2013; 2017; Jeannot et al.,
89 2018). The reduction of dimensionality is mainly associated with a subsurface compartment
90 (including both the vadose and the saturated zones) modeled as a two-dimensional layer.
91 **Some low-dimensional models, as the one employed in this study, can solve subsurface flow**

92 via an integrated Richard's equation, meaning that flow and transport processes are
93 integrated over a vertical direction or a direction normal to bedrock, and manipulate averaged
94 (integrated) hydrodynamic properties. This type of low-dimensional approach recently
95 demonstrated its ability to reproduce the results from fully dimensioned approaches in small
96 catchments while reducing computational costs (Pan et al., 2015; Jeannot et al., 2018).
97 Nonetheless, the water transit times calculated from these depth-integrated models are
98 rarely confronted with the water-rock interaction times inferred from hydrogeochemical
99 modeling of water chemistry in watersheds.

100 For its part, the understanding of the hydrogeochemical functioning of the critical zone has
101 been significantly advanced by the implementation of reactive-transport laws in geochemical
102 modeling codes (Steefel et al., 2005; Lucas et al., 2010; 2017; Godd ris et al., 2013; Li et al.,
103 2017). These developments allow for considering a variety of processes, such as flow and
104 transport processes, ion exchanges, biogeochemical reactions, and the interplay between
105 primary mineral dissolution and secondary mineral precipitation (Moore et al., 2012;
106 Lebedeva and Brantley, 2013; Ackerer et al., 2018). Reactive transport models have been used
107 to explore a wide variety of scientific issues, including the study of global atmospheric CO₂
108 consumption by weathering reactions (Godd ris et al., 2013; Li et al., 2014), the formation
109 and evolution of soil and regolith profiles (Maher et al., 2009; Navarre-Sitchler et al., 2009;
110 Lebedeva and Brantley, 2013), and the variability of water quality and chemistry in the
111 environment (Lucas et al., 2010; 2017; Ackerer et al., 2018). However, these approaches
112 usually rely on a simple 1D flow path through a regolith column or along a hill slope to model
113 flow in the system (e.g. Maher, 2011; Moore et al., 2012; Lucas et al., 2017; Ackerer et al.,
114 2018). 1D reactive-transport models are useful to discuss the key processes involved in the
115 regolith formation and in the acquisition of the water chemical composition, but these models

116 cannot consider the complexity of the flow trajectories in watersheds, and hence, its effects
117 on the water chemistry.

118 A new step is therefore necessary for the development of hydrogeochemical modeling
119 approaches that are applicable at the watershed scale and are able to integrate the complexity
120 of the water flows and the diversity of the water-rock interaction processes. Recent efforts
121 have been undertaken in the direction of merging hydrological and geochemical codes, with
122 for example, the parallel reactive transport code ParCrunchFlow (Beisman et al., 2015), or the
123 coupled hydrogeochemical code RT-Flux-PIHM (Bao et al., 2017; Li et al., 2017). As an
124 alternative to fully dimensioned codes, this work proposes an original low-dimensional
125 approach, with relatively short computation times and applicable at the watershed scale. This
126 study is combining for the first time in this manner the results from a hydrological low-
127 dimensional (depth-integrated for the subsurface) but spatially distributed model (NIHM) with
128 a reactive-transport model (KIRMAT). The combination allows for simulating over time and
129 space the flow trajectories, the flow rates, the weathering reactions, and the evolution of the
130 water chemistry within a headwater system, the Strengbach catchment.

131 This catchment is one of the reference observatories of the French critical zone network
132 (OZCAR), where multidisciplinary studies, including hydrological, geochemical and geological
133 investigations, have been performed since 1986 (“Observatoire Hydrogéochimique de
134 l’Environnement”, OHGE; <http://ohge.unistra.fr>; El Gh’Mari, 1995; Fichter et al., 1998; Viville
135 et al., 2012; Gangloff et al., 2014; 2016; Prunier et al., 2015; Pan et al., 2015; Ackerer et al.,
136 2016; 2018; Beaulieu et al., 2016; Chabaux et al., 2017; 2019; Schmitt et al., 2017; 2018; Daval
137 et al., 2018; see also Pierret et al., 2018 for an updated overview of the Strengbach
138 watershed).

139 **2- Site presentation and data acquisition**

140 The Strengbach catchment is a small watershed (0.8 km²) located in the Vosges Mountains of
141 northeastern France at altitudes between 883 and 1147 m. Its hydroclimatic characteristics
142 can be found in Viville et al. (2012) or in Pierret et al. (2018). It is marked by a mountainous
143 oceanic climate, with an annual mean temperature of 6 °C and an annual mean rainfall of
144 approximately 1400 mm, with 15 to 20% falling as snow during two to four months per year.
145 The snow cover period is quite variable from year to year, and may not be continuous over
146 the entire winter. The annual mean evapotranspiration is of approximately 600 mm, and the
147 annual mean infiltration (no significant surface runoff observed) of approximately 800 mm
148 (Viville et al., 2012). The watershed is currently covered by a beech and spruce forest. The
149 bedrock is a base-poor Hercynian granite covered by a 50 to 100 cm-thick acidic and coarse-
150 in-texture soil. The granitic bedrock was fractured and hydrothermally altered, with a stronger
151 degree of hydrothermal overprinting in the northern than the southern part of the catchment
152 (Fichter et al., 1998). The granite was also affected by surface weathering processes during
153 the Quaternary (Ackerer et al., 2016). The porous and uppermost part of the granitic
154 basement constitutes an aquifer from 2 to approximately 8 m thickness. In the Strengbach
155 watershed, the major floods and high-flow events usually occur during snowmelt periods at
156 the end of the winter season or in the early spring. By contrast, the low-flow periods
157 commonly happen at the end of the summer or during the autumn. Several springs naturally
158 emerge along the slopes (figure 1). The watershed has been equipped with several
159 piezometers and boreholes since 2012, those being located along the slopes on both sides of
160 the watershed (figure 1 in Chabaux et al., 2017).

161 Spring waters have been regularly collected and analyzed since 2005, with monthly sampling
162 supplemented by a few specific campaigns to cover the complete range of water discharges
163 in the watershed. Piezometer waters have been collected only during specific sampling
164 campaigns over the period 2012-2015, and, as for the spring waters, these sampling
165 campaigns cover different hydrological conditions from wet to dry periods. The soil solutions
166 were collected with a monthly frequency on the southern slope at a beech site (named HP)
167 and to the north at a spruce site (named VP; figure 1; more details in Prunier et al., 2015). For
168 all the collected waters, the concentrations of the major dissolved species and the pH were
169 determined by following the analytical techniques used at LHyGeS (Strasbourg, France) and
170 detailed in Gangloff et al. (2014) and Prunier et al. (2015). Discharges of water from the springs
171 were measured during the sampling campaigns, as were the water levels within the
172 piezometers.

173 The mineralogy and the porosity of the bedrock have been studied in detail in previous studies
174 (El Gh'Mari, 1995; Fichter et al., 1998). On the southern part of the catchment, the weakly
175 hydrothermally altered granite (named HPT, figure 1) is mainly composed of quartz (35%),
176 albite (31%), K-feldspar (22%) and biotite (6%). It also contains small amounts of muscovite
177 (3%), anorthite (2%), apatite (0.5%) and clay minerals (0.5%). On the northern part of the
178 catchment, the lithology is more variable, with the presence of gneiss close to the crest lines
179 and the occurrence of hydrothermally altered granite on the rest of the slopes (El Gh'Mari,
180 1995, figure 1).

181 The hydrological, geochemical and petrological data obtained from these field investigations
182 are the basis of the modeling exercise presented in this study. More precisely, this study is
183 based on hydrogeochemical data from 2005 to 2015 for waters from four springs of the

184 southern part (CS1, CS2, CS3 and CS4) and one spring of the northern part (RH3) of the
185 watershed (figure 1). Hydrogeochemical data obtained over the period 2012-2015 for two
186 piezometers (PZ3, PZ5) of the southern part of the watershed are also studied (figure 1). The
187 overall hydrogeochemical database is available as supplementary tables (tables EA1 to EA9).
188 The specific chemical data from spring and piezometer waters modeled in this study are
189 reported in table 1.

190 **3- Modeling methods**

191 The modeling developments presented in this study represent a new step in the efforts
192 undertaken to constrain the mechanisms controlling the geochemical composition of surface
193 waters and to understand their spatial and temporal variations at the scale of headwater
194 mountainous catchments (Schaffhauser et al., 2014; Lucas et al., 2017; Ackerer et al., 2018).
195 The main innovation of this present work is to couple a spatially distributed and low-
196 dimensional hydrological model with a reactive transport code to constrain the
197 spatiotemporal variability of chemical composition of waters. To the best of our knowledge,
198 this is the first time that such a coupling between low-dimensional hydrological and
199 hydrogeochemical modeling approaches has been attempted in this way at the watershed
200 scale.

201 **3-1 Hydrological modeling**

202 To assess the water flows in the watershed, several simulations were performed with the
203 hydrological code NIHM (Normally Integrated Hydrological Model; Pan et al., 2015; Weill et
204 al., 2017; Jeannot et al., 2018). This code is a coupled stream, overland, and low-dimensional
205 (depth-integrated) subsurface flow model developed at LHyGeS and already tested in the
206 Strengbach watershed (Pan et al., 2015). The stream and overland flows are described by a

207 diffusive-wave equation, and the subsurface flow is handled through an integration (in a
208 direction normal to bedrock) of the unsaturated-saturated flow equation from the bedrock to
209 the soil surface (Weill et al., 2017). The exchanges of water between the surface and
210 subsurface flows are addressed via a first-order exchange coefficient involving the thickness
211 and the hydraulic conductivity of an interface layer (e.g., the riverbed, for interactions
212 between surface routing and subsurface compartments), and the hydraulic head differences
213 between the compartments (Jeannot et al., 2018).

214 Regarding the hydrological simulations, NIHM was used with only its stream flow and
215 subsurface flow compartments activated, the Strengbach catchment having never evidenced
216 diffuse two-dimensional surface runoff or subsurface exfiltration over large areas. In addition,
217 and because of the steep slopes, the stream flow process revealed almost insensitive to the
218 roughness and Manning's parameters of the riverbed, which were set to usual values for very
219 small streams of mountainous landscapes. By contrast, the parameters of the subsurface were
220 adjusted in NIHM through a calibration-validation process. Several zones of heterogeneity
221 (figure 2) were defined based on field observations (Ackerer et al., 2016; Chabaux et al., 2017).
222 In each of these zones, the saturated hydraulic conductivity, the depth of substratum, and the
223 porosity, were set to uniform values. Other parameters (the residual water content, the
224 specific storage, the Van Genuchten coefficients n and α , and the saturated hydraulic
225 conductivity of the interface layer between the groundwater compartment and the surface
226 compartment) were set to uniform values over the whole catchment (table 2). The thickness
227 of the aquifer that was used for the simulations varied from 2 m near the main crests to up to
228 8 m in the middle of the watershed (figure 2), in agreement with the data obtained during the
229 recent geological investigations and drilling campaigns undertaken at the catchment (Ackerer
230 et al., 2016; Chabaux et al., 2017). The uniform precipitations over space applied at the surface

231 of the catchment are drawn from data of the pluviometric station located at the highest
232 elevation of the watershed (site PA, figure 1). The hydrological model NIHM was then run over
233 a first time period (years 1996-1997). By a Monte-Carlo approach, the parameters were
234 “randomly” sought to improve the fitting between the observed and simulated flow rates at
235 the outlet of the catchment (table 2). The fit was quantified by the root mean square error
236 (RMSE) and the Kling-Gupta efficiency coefficient (KGE; Gupta et al., 2009), applied to the
237 outlet flow rate of the stream, which is the only reliable and always available hydrological
238 variable monitored in the system.

239 Once the best fit was obtained, the model was then run over another time period (2010-2015),
240 but without changing the parameters anymore, and the quality of the fit was re-assessed for
241 this new time-period with the KGE and RMSE. Figure 2 shows the result for the 2010-2015
242 time period. Once the water discharges were correctly reproduced at the outlet, a
243 backtracking approach was used to constrain the origin of subsurface water exiting the system
244 at prescribed locations, and the spatiotemporal variability of the flow lines within the
245 watershed. To back track the water particles, the velocity fields calculated by the NIHM model
246 were inverted in their direction, and the locations of the backtracked particles were saved at
247 each time-step. A daily time-step was used for the backtracking, as a compromise between
248 computational efforts and a refined description of the transient velocity fields. A schematic
249 representation of the backtracking approach is given in figure 3. This methodology allows for
250 constraining the flow lines that bring waters for a given time and at a given position on the
251 catchment. This information is of major interest to determine the origin of the spring and
252 piezometer waters. It is shown at the catchment scale, that flows are mainly driven by gravity
253 in association with the steep slopes of the watershed, the latter being almost evenly drained
254 over its whole surface area (figure 4). For each water sampling area, ten flow lines that bring

255 water to the location of interest were determined (figure 4), together with a few features of
256 the flow lines, including: local velocities, mean velocities, and length of the flow paths.

257 It is worth noting that NIHM is a depth-integrated model for its subsurface compartment
258 where flow is simulated over a 2D-mesh and under the assumption of an instantaneous
259 hydrostatic equilibrium in the direction perpendicular to the substratum. Therefore, times
260 calculated along the backtracked streamlines correspond to a date, x days before arrival, at
261 which a water particle entered the subsurface or passed at a given location along the
262 streamline. Streamlines calculated via backtracking and reaching sampling sites only consider
263 flow in the subsurface compartment and are conditional to an arrival date at a prescribed
264 location. As backtracked streamlines are not associated with mean water flux values, the
265 transit time distributions drawn from streamline calculations are only an approximation of the
266 actual transit time distributions.

267 It should also be noted that, knowing the water head at a given location, the assumption of
268 an instantaneous hydrostatic equilibrium over the direction perpendicular to the substratum
269 directly renders the associated water pressure over the whole aquifer along that direction.
270 Then, since the water pressure, saturated hydraulic conductivity, porosity, residual water
271 content, and Van Genuchten coefficients are known, the Van Genuchten equation can be
272 integrated numerically, which gives to NIHM the possibility to calculate local depth-integrated
273 hydraulic conductivities over the direction perpendicular to the substratum.

274 With a conditioning of NIHM limited to the reproduction of the stream flow rates at its outlet,
275 it can be questioned on the reliability of the solution, equifinalities in model outputs being
276 usually all the more present that few data are available to condition the model. The point is
277 that there is no other reliable information on flow patterns, and for example, the few

278 boreholes available (mainly drilled for rock core sampling) are deep enough to intercept a few
279 fractures in the bedrock (under the bottom of the aquifer simulated by NIHM). This renders
280 the water levels monitored in these open boreholes unable to reflect hydraulic pressure heads
281 in the active shallow porous aquifer of the catchment. Nevertheless, the steep slopes of the
282 catchment are the main feature conditioning water velocities, thus rendering transit times
283 (the variable of interest for a geochemical study) very stable over time, irrespective of hydro-
284 meteorological conditions and current head pressure in the system. After the present study
285 was completed, NIHM was employed at the Strengbach to simulate water content
286 distributions with the aim to mimic data from magnetic resonance sounding (Weill et al.,
287 2019). The model was slightly improved in terms of storage and its variability over space, but
288 the modeled distribution of flow paths, their variability, and the associated transit time
289 distributions remained unchanged.

290 **3-2 Hydrogeochemical modeling**

291 The simulations of the water chemical composition along the flow lines were performed with
292 the hydrogeochemical KIRMAT code (Kinetic of Reaction and MAAss Transport; Gérard et al.,
293 1998; Lucas et al., 2010; Ngo et al., 2014). KIRMAT is a thermokinetic model derived from the
294 Transition State Theory (TST, Eyring, 1935; Murphy and Helgeson, 1987) that simultaneously
295 solves the equations describing geochemical reactions and transport mass balance in a 1D-
296 porous medium. The mass transport includes the effects of one-dimensional convection,
297 diffusion and kinematic dispersion. Chemical reactions account for the dissolution of primary
298 minerals and oxido-reduction reactions, in addition to the formation of secondary minerals
299 and clay minerals. Thermodynamic and kinetic data for the primary minerals are available in
300 supplementary materials (tables EA10, EA11 and EA12).

301 The clay fraction is defined as a solid solution made up of a combination of pure clay end-
302 members. The clay end-members are defined on the basis of X-ray diffraction analyses of clay
303 minerals present in bedrock samples collected in the field (Fichter et al., 1998; Ackerer et al.,
304 2016; 2018). They consist of K-Illites, Mg-Illites, Ca-Illites, Montmorillonites, Na-
305 Montmorillonites, K-Montmorillonites, Ca-Montmorillonites and Mg-Montmorillonites
306 (supplementary material table EA13). During the hydrogeochemical simulations, the clay solid
307 solution is precipitated at thermodynamic equilibrium and its composition varies over time,
308 depending on the evolution of the water chemistry and the bedrock mineralogy (Ackerer et
309 al., 2018). This multicomponent solid solution reproduces the impurity of the clay minerals
310 formed during low-temperature water-rock interactions (Tardy and Fritz, 1981).

311 The KIRMAT code also includes feedback effects between mineral mass budgets, reactive
312 surfaces, and the evolution of bedrock porosity (Ngo et al., 2014). The reactive surfaces of the
313 primary minerals were calculated by assuming a simple spherical geometry for all the
314 minerals, and the mean size of the minerals was estimated from the observation of thin
315 sections from bedrock samples. During simulations, clay mineral precipitation and the
316 evolution of the reactive surfaces of primary minerals are tracked together with chemical
317 processes and water chemical composition. Given the short time scales reported by the
318 hydrological simulations (monthly timescale), changes in the reactive surfaces of primary
319 minerals over the simulation time were negligible. Precipitation of other secondary minerals
320 such as carbonates, hematite or amorphous silica was also tested, but these minerals were
321 not formed given the saturation states calculated in the geochemical modeling
322 (supplementary table EA14). Secondary mineral precipitation is therefore controlled by clay
323 mineral formation. The KIRMAT code has already been applied in geochemical modeling of

324 alluvial subsurface waters (Lucas et al., 2010) and surface waters (Lucas et al., 2017; Ackerer
325 et al., 2018).

326 For this study, the modeling strategy is adapted from Ackerer et al. (2018) to consider the new
327 transit time constrains provided by the hydrological code NIHM. To capture the chemical
328 composition of the spring and the piezometer waters, numerical simulations were performed
329 along the subsurface streamlines that were determined through the backtracking approach.
330 A sketch of the hydrogeochemical modeling strategy is provided in figure 5. For each
331 streamline, several KIRMAT simulations were performed with different starting positions
332 along the active part of the line. The starting positions represent the locations at which the
333 soil solutions percolate through the subsurface shallow aquifer. **These starting positions are
334 spaced with a constant lag distance of 1 m along the subsurface streamlines, which results in
335 a sub-continuous percolation of solutions along the whole length of the lines.** The deepest soil
336 solutions collected to the south at the beech site (HP) and to the north at the spruce site (VP)
337 were considered representative of the soil solutions for the southern and northern slopes of
338 the catchment, respectively. The data of soil solution chemistry used in this study are available
339 in Prunier et al. (2015) and in supplementary tables (tables EA6 and EA7). These soil solutions
340 integrate the surface processes occurring before water percolation into the weathered
341 bedrock (regolith). Because the soil solutions can be injected into the aquifer at various times,
342 the temporal variability of the soil solution chemistry and its impact on the water-rock
343 interactions along the flow paths are accounted for in the modeling approach.

344 Data related to the regolith properties, such as the mineralogical compositions, the mineral
345 reactive surfaces and the thermodynamic and kinetic constants are given in Ackerer et al.
346 (2018) and in supplementary tables (tables EA10 to EA14). Mineral phases are assumed

347 homogeneously distributed over the regolith layer. By following this strategy, the simulations
348 that consider soil solutions percolating at the upper part of the catchment reflect the chemical
349 evolution of waters with long path lengths and long transit times within the aquifer. By
350 contrast, shorter path lengths and shorter transit times are associated with the percolation of
351 soil solutions that occurs in the vicinity of the sampling locations (figure 5). Because the springs
352 or the piezometers collect waters from different origins and with various transit times,
353 integration along each water flow line was performed. The aim of the integration is to
354 determine the mean chemical composition resulting from the mixing of the waters
355 characterized by variable transit times (figure 5). The integrated chemical composition of the
356 waters provided by a given flow line is calculated by taking the arithmetic mean of the solute
357 concentrations calculated by the succession of the KIRMAT simulations along the flow line
358 (figure 5). This arithmetic mean reflects a simple full mixing of uniform water fluxes along a
359 stream line irrespective of the short or long transit times. In other words, the geochemical
360 simulations are based on the hypothesis of spatially homogenous water-rock interactions
361 along the flow lines. The soil solutions are assumed to percolate uniformly within the aquifer
362 and are then conveyed along the slopes by uniformly distributed masses of water until
363 reaching the sampling locations. When needed, the eventual calculation of water chemistry
364 exiting several stream lines reaching a sampling location accounts for the spreading associated
365 with various flow paths, spatial variability of water velocities and related travel times.

366 **4- Hydrological modeling results**

367 **4-1 Spatial variability of the flow lines**

368 The results provided by the hydrological code NIHM show that to the first order, the
369 Strengbach catchment is well drained and that the topography exerts an important control on

370 the flow line distribution (figure 4). Along the hillsides presenting linear or slightly convex
371 slopes, the water flow lines show simple characteristics. The flow paths are nearly parallel,
372 and the water velocities are similar along the different flow lines on this type of hillside. The
373 water velocities tend to increase when moving downstream, with slower velocities near the
374 main crests and higher velocities on the steepest parts of the hillsides. The waters collected
375 along this type of hillside are therefore characterized by small variability of transit times. This
376 is the case for the CS1, CS3 and RH3 spring waters located on the southern and northern parts
377 of the catchment (figure 4). This is also the case for the piezometers PZ3 and PZ5 in the
378 southern part of the watershed (figure 4). For the sites located on linear or slightly convex
379 slopes (CS1, CS3, RH3, PZ3 and PZ5), all the characteristics of the different flow lines that feed
380 each site are therefore comparable for a given site and for a given date.

381 By contrast, in the vicinity of the valley and in the topographic depressions, the hydrological
382 modeling indicates that the flow line characteristics are more variable. Because flow lines
383 coming from different hill-sides can feed a topographic depression, mixing of different flow
384 lines with variable flow paths and contrasted water velocities can occur at these locations.
385 The waters collected in valleys or in topographic depressions are therefore characterized by a
386 higher variability of transit times. This is the case for the CS2 and CS4 springs, which are
387 located in a depression, in the axe of the small valley, and surrounded by slopes with various
388 orientations, and a complex flow line distribution (figure 4). For these two springs, the
389 characteristics of the different flow lines can be different for a given date.

390 **4-2 Temporal variability of the flow lines**

391 Hydrological modeling under general transient conditions can render the evolution over time
392 of water flows in the watershed but also of other hydraulic variables. As an example, after an

393 important rainfall event (30/03/2010 in figure 6), snapshots of the integrated hydraulic
394 conductivity (modeled via the Van Genuchten formulation) in the subsurface and simulated
395 by NIHM at the scale of the mesh size show increasing values with decreasing elevation in the
396 watershed. The same observation holds for conductivities during drought periods (see
397 29/11/2011, in figure 6). Provided that the hydraulic head gradient is largely dominated by
398 the topography and therefore almost constant over time (figure 6), the water velocities are
399 increasing along the flow lines from crests to valleys, irrespective of the wet versus dry
400 hydrological periods. However, it is noticeable that wet periods are favorable to a large
401 extension in the valleys of high values of depth averaged hydraulic conductivity indicating that
402 the aquifer is locally almost completely saturated from bottom to top (e.g., values of 6.5×10^{-5}
403 ms^{-1} in figure 6 for a saturated bound at $8 \cdot 10^{-5} \text{ms}^{-1}$).

404 For the CS1 spring, the mean flow velocities along the flow lines vary from approximately 1
405 m/day to 7 m/day between the severe drought of 29/11/2011 and the strong flood of
406 30/03/2010 (figures 7A and 7B). These events correspond to the annual minimum and
407 maximum flow rates at the outlet of the Strengbach watershed. For the same dates, the mean
408 velocities vary from 2 – 12 m/day, 1 – 4 m/day and 1 – 9 m/day for the springs CS2, CS3 and
409 CS4, respectively. The variations from drought to flood are very similar for the piezometer
410 waters, with velocities in the ranges 2 – 10 m/day and 2 – 12 m/day for the PZ3 and PZ5
411 piezometers, respectively. The RH3 spring located on a steeper part of the northern slopes
412 exhibits flow velocity variations from 5 to 20 m/day from dry to flood conditions.

413 In addition to the flow velocity variations, the hydrological simulations also reveal variability
414 in the lengths of the active parts of the flow lines. For illustration, the active parts of the flow
415 lines are reduced from 160 m to 110 m from the flood to the drought events for the CS1 spring

416 (figures 7A and 7B). Such variability is triggered by the particular seasonal variations of the
417 hydraulic conductivities within the catchment. After important precipitations, high water
418 content and large integrated hydraulic conductivities (sometimes up to the saturated bound)
419 are simulated in the vicinity of the crests and all along the small valley of the catchment (figure
420 6). During periods of drought, the simulations indicate a strong decrease of hydraulic
421 conductivities close to the main crests and much smaller variations at mid-slopes (figure 6).
422 The crests rapidly dry out, whereas the areas at mid-slopes still supply some water to the
423 stream network. These contrasting hydrological behaviors result from the differences in
424 aquifer thickness and water storage between the crests and the other parts of the catchment
425 (figure 2). Thin aquifer, flow divergence and absence of feeding areas prevent large water
426 storage on the crests, in opposition to mid-slope parts with much thicker aquifers and the
427 presence of feeding areas upstream. This particular pattern simulated for the hydraulic
428 conductivities implies that the active parts of the flow lines extend up the main crests during
429 important floods, whereas they are limited to mid-slopes after a long dry period.

430 The consequence of this hydrological functioning is to moderate the seasonal variations of the
431 transit times of waters, as the active lengths of flow lines vary simultaneously with water flow
432 rates. Calculations indicate that for the spring and piezometer waters collected in this study,
433 the mean transit times of waters only vary from approximately 1.75 to 4 months between the
434 strongest flood and the driest conditions. Notably, these short subsurface water transit times
435 are explained by the small size of the catchment and the steep slopes.

436 5- Hydrogeochemical modeling results

437 5-1 CS1 and CS3 springs (southern slope)

438 The CS1 and CS3 springs emerge on the same slope and drain the same rocks. Their
439 hydrological behavior is also very similar in terms of flow lines and water transit times. The
440 interesting consequence of the simple flow line distribution for these springs is that a single
441 flow line can be considered as representative of all the flow lines that are feeding the spring,
442 irrespective of the hydrological conditions. Hydrogeochemical simulations were performed
443 along a single flow line for different hydrological periods using the methodology illustrated in
444 figure 5. The case of CS1 spring is used below to highlight the main results obtained from this
445 approach. For the strong flood of 30/03/2010, the KIRMAT simulations modeling the waters
446 coming from the vicinity of the spring and characterized by short transit times produced too
447 much diluted solutions, whereas the waters coming from the main crests were too much
448 concentrated to reproduce the spring water chemical composition. However, after an
449 integration of all the waters arriving at CS1 with the different transit times employed for the
450 simulation, the resulting geochemical composition correctly reproduces the chemical
451 composition of CS1 spring water at this date (H_4SiO_4 , Na^+ , K^+ , Mg^{2+} , and Ca^{2+} concentrations,
452 [figure 7D](#)). A similar conclusion is obtained for the important drought of 29/11/2011. Again,
453 geochemical integration of all the waters arriving at CS1 along a water line but with different
454 transit times correctly reproduces the chemical composition of the CS1 spring waters collected
455 on this date ([figure 7C](#)). [This comment applies regardless of the time period considered.](#)

456 The coupled hydrological and hydrogeochemical approach has been applied for the CS1 spring
457 for 6 dates covering the whole range of the water discharges of the spring (table 1). The
458 modeling results capture the seasonal variations of the water chemical composition of the CS1
459 spring over the whole range of observed flow rates at CS1 (figure 8). Simulations especially
460 reproduce the 20-30% variation in H_4SiO_4 concentrations (figure 8A), the 10-20% variation in
461 Na^+ concentrations (figure 8C), and the relatively stability of the K^+ , Mg^{2+} and pH of the CS1

462 waters (figure 8E, 8F and 8D). The response of each chemical element to a change in water
463 discharge is related to the initial soil solution concentration, the nature of primary minerals
464 controlling its budget and the degree of its incorporation into clay minerals. Specific
465 concentration-mean transit time relations (C-MTT relations) explain why the response of
466 solute concentrations to hydrological changes (C-Q relations) is different for each element
467 (figure 9). Similar results are obtained for the CS3 spring (figure EA1), showing, as for the CS1
468 spring, that the model correctly simulates the water chemical composition of the CS3 spring.

469 Because the lengths of the flow lines vary over time, the patterns of dissolution rates for
470 primary minerals and precipitation rates for clay minerals are mainly controlled by the spatial
471 and temporal variability of the flow lines. During wet conditions, the upper parts of the
472 catchment are the areas of maximal dissolution rates of primary minerals and of maximal
473 precipitation rates of clay minerals in the regolith. During dry conditions, the dissolution and
474 precipitation rates are maximal at mid-slopes, as the upper parts of the catchment are simply
475 dry.

476 **5-2 PZ3 and PZ5 piezometers (southern slope)**

477 The two piezometers PZ3 and PZ5 are located on the southern part of the catchment, and
478 their waters drain a granitic bedrock similar to that drained by the CS sources. As for the CS1
479 and CS3 springs, the NIHM modeling results show that the flow lines arriving at the PZ3
480 piezometer are characterized by a relatively simple distribution (figure 4). For the PZ5
481 piezometer located downstream, the flow lines cover a larger area on the slope, especially
482 during droughts (figure 4). However, for a given date, all the flow lines show similar velocities,
483 with particularly fast flow in the lower portion of the hillslope. These results imply that, as for
484 the CS1 and CS3 springs, the hydrogeochemical simulations of PZ3 and PZ5 piezometer waters

485 can be performed by relying upon a single flow line representative of all the waters collected
486 by the piezometers on a given date. The geochemical integration is able to reproduce the
487 chemical composition of the waters of the two piezometers, as illustrated in figure 10 for the
488 flood of the 05/05/2015 and in figure EA2 for the dry conditions of 10/11/2015. Together,
489 these modeling results show that the flow along linear or slightly convex slopes on the
490 southern part of the catchment allows to correctly capture the water chemistry of each
491 sampling site with a straightforward integration along a single and representative flow line.

492 **5-3 The CS2 and CS4 springs (in the valley axe)**

493 CS2 and CS4 spring waters drain the same granitic bedrock as the CS1 and CS3 waters, but are
494 located in the direction of the small valley of the Strengbach stream and surrounded by slopes
495 of various orientations and inclinations (figure 4). Consequently, the distribution of the flow
496 lines is much more scattered than for the CS1 and CS3 springs. For the CS2 spring, and for all
497 the hydrological conditions, two different groups of flow lines have been determined by the
498 backtracking approach: a northern group characterized by relatively slow velocities and a
499 southern group with higher velocities (figure 4 and figures 11A, 11B). This scattered
500 distribution of the flow lines implies that a single specific flow line cannot be representative
501 of all the waters collected by the spring. The flow lines calculated using the NIHM model allow
502 for constraining the trajectories of the waters within the watershed; however, the simulations
503 performed in this study cannot provide the mass fluxes of water carried by each flow line.
504 Consequently, a straightforward calculation of the chemistry of the CS2 spring, such as
505 depicted above for CS1, is not applicable because the mixing proportions between the
506 different flow lines are unknown.

507 Alternatively, it is possible to determine the concentrations in the waters carried by the
508 slowest and the fastest flow lines that are feeding the spring and to compare the results with
509 the observed chemistry of the spring water. The results indicate that for all the hydrological
510 conditions, the concentrations calculated from the geochemical integration along the slowest
511 and the fastest flow lines are able to correctly frame the chemical composition in terms of
512 H_4SiO_4 , Na^+ , K^+ , Mg^{2+} , and Ca^{2+} of the CS2 spring waters (results are reported for H_4SiO_4 and
513 Na^+ in figures 11C and 11D). The modeling results for CS2 also suggest that the contributions
514 of the slow and fast flow lines are comparable over most of the hydrological conditions, as the
515 observed concentrations are in general at the midpoint between the min (i.e., fast) and max
516 (i.e., slow) boundaries (figures 11C and 11D). It is only for the important droughts that the
517 spring chemistry seems to be mainly controlled by the southern and faster group of flow lines.
518 Further works to precisely estimate the mass fluxes of water carried by each flow line are
519 necessary to model the chemistry of the CS2 spring water with a weighted mixing calculation.
520 The same conclusions apply to the CS4 spring located close to CS2.

521 **5-4 The RH3 spring (northern slope)**

522 The RH3 spring is located on the northern part of the catchment (figure 4), where steep slopes
523 imply fast water velocities and subparallel flow lines. However, if the distribution of the flow
524 lines on the RH3 hillside is simple (as for the CS1 and CS3 springs) the precise lithological
525 nature of the bedrock drained by the RH3 waters is more difficult to constrain (Ackerer et al.,
526 2018). Unlike the southern slope, the bedrock of the northern part of the catchment reveals
527 a complex lithology, with gneiss outcropping in the upper part of the slope and granite of
528 variable degree of hydrothermal overprinting in the intermediate and lower parts. These
529 lithological variations can explain the differences in chemical composition between the RH3

530 spring waters and the waters of the southern part of the catchment: the RH3 spring waters
531 are characterized by systematically higher concentrations of K^+ and Mg^{2+} cations but show
532 similar concentrations for the other major elements (Ackerer et al., 2018; Pierret et al., 2018).
533 The vertical extension of the gneiss and the spatial variability of the hydrothermal overprinting
534 along the northern slopes are not well known, with the consequence that a straightforward
535 modeling of water chemistry as done for CS1 is not possible for RH3.

536 Alternatively, simulations of two extreme cases can be performed by assuming that the flow
537 lines only run, either on gneiss or on hydrothermally altered granite. When only considering
538 the hydrothermally altered granite (VS facies), the simulated concentrations of H_4SiO_4 and Na^+
539 are close to the measured ones. Nevertheless, the concentrations of K^+ and especially Mg^{2+}
540 are clearly underestimated (figure 12B). In the case of the flow lines only running on gneiss
541 (GN facies), the simulated concentrations of H_4SiO_4 and Na^+ also match the data. However,
542 due to the higher abundance of biotite in the gneiss, the simulated concentrations of K^+ and
543 Mg^{2+} are higher than the measured ones (figure 12A). At this stage, it is therefore reasonable
544 to propose that the chemical composition of the RH3 spring waters reflects mixing of the two
545 lithological influences. By assuming a geochemical conservative mixing, which is likely a too
546 simplistic scenario, the results would indicate that the flow lines portions running on gneiss
547 and on hydrothermally altered granite count for approximately 40-50% and 50-60% of the
548 total water path length, respectively.

549 Further works to estimate the location of the contact between gneiss and granite are required
550 for more realistic modeling and hence a deeper interpretation of the chemical composition of
551 the RH3 spring waters. In any case, the important point to stress here based on the above
552 simulations is that the complex lithology and bedrock heterogeneity mainly impact the K^+ and

553 the Mg^{2+} budget of the RH3 waters, but not or only slightly the H_4SiO_4 and Na^+ concentrations,
554 which control the main part of global weathering fluxes carried by the Strengbach spring
555 waters. These results readily explain why although the RH3 spring waters exhibits higher Mg^{2+}
556 and K^+ concentrations than the other CS springs, they carry relatively similar global weathering
557 fluxes (Viville et al., 2012; Ackerer et al., 2018).

558 **6- Discussion**

559 The coupling of the NIHM and KIRMAT codes allows for building a better modeling scheme to
560 those commonly used in previous studies regarding the hydrogeochemical modeling of
561 surface waters at the watershed scale. In such previous works, the geochemical simulations
562 were performed mainly along a single 1D flow line, only characterized by homogeneous mean
563 hydrological properties (Godd ris et al., 2006; Maher, 2011; Moore et al., 2012; Lucas et al.,
564 2017; Ackerer et al., 2018). In a previous study on the Strengbach watershed (Ackerer et al.,
565 2018), the soil solutions were also assumed to percolate in the bedrock only at a single starting
566 point of the flow lines. Although these previous approaches were useful for determining the
567 long-term evolution of regolith profiles and/or the mean chemistry of waters at the pluri-
568 annual scale, they cannot be used to discuss the seasonal variations of the water chemical
569 composition. The NIHM-KIRMAT coupling approach makes this possible, as it provides the
570 spatial distribution of the flow lines at the watershed scale and their variations over time.
571 Furthermore, the proposed modeling approach also integrates a soil solution percolation
572 scheme with inlets uniformly distributed along the slope, which is more realistic than a
573 scheme assuming that each sampled site is fed by a single flow line carrying waters with a
574 unique transit time. **The good agreement between modeling results and observations over a**

575 large panel of hydrological conditions gives strength to the conclusions and implications that
576 can be drawn regarding the hydrogeochemical functioning of this headwater catchment.

577 **6-1 Choices of the reactive surfaces and the kinetic constants**

578 For the geochemical simulations performed in this study, the kinetic constants that were used
579 to describe the dissolution reactions of the primary minerals are standard constants
580 determined through laboratory experiments (supplementary table EA12). The reactive
581 surfaces of the primary minerals were calculated by assuming a simple spherical geometry for
582 all the minerals (supplementary table EA10). Over the last years, several studies have
583 suggested that the kinetic constants determined through laboratory experiments
584 overestimated the rates of the dissolution reactions in natural environments (White and
585 Brantley, 2003; Zhu, 2005; Moore et al., 2012; Fischer et al., 2014). The origin of this
586 laboratory-field discrepancy is still a matter of debate (Fischer et al., 2014). Different
587 processes have been proposed to explain the gap between laboratory and field estimates,
588 such as the crystallographic anisotropy (Pollet-Villard et al., 2016), progressive occlusion of
589 the primary minerals by clays (White and Brantley, 2003), or the formation of passivation
590 layers at the surfaces of the minerals (Wild et al., 2016, Daval et al., 2018). The difficulty to
591 reconcile field and laboratory estimates can also be related to the challenge of defining
592 relevant reactive surfaces at different space scales (Li et al., 2006; Navarre-Sitchler and
593 Brantley, 2007).

594 The present modeling work regarding the Strengbach catchment shows that the chemical
595 composition variability of the spring and piezometer waters is fully captured via geometric
596 reactive surfaces and standard kinetic constants, while respecting the water-rock interaction
597 times within the catchment. This result suggests that the mean rates of the weathering

598 reactions employed in this modeling work are realistic, which in turn implies that the modeling
599 approach developed in this study does not underline significant mismatches between field
600 and laboratory reaction rates. The calculated rates of the dissolution reactions depend on the
601 product between the kinetic constants of the reactions and the mineral reactive surfaces. In
602 the experimental studies performed for determining the kinetic constants of dissolution
603 reactions, the constants are usually determined by normalizing the experimental weathering
604 rates with the Brunauer-Emmett-Teller surfaces determined from experiments of gas
605 absorption (BET surfaces; Chou and Wollast, 1986; Lundstrom and Ohman, 1990; Acker and
606 Bricker, 1992; Amrhein and Suarez, 1992; Berger et al., 1994; Guidry and Mackenzie, 2003).

607 In table 3, the BET surfaces are compared with the geometric surfaces of the minerals involved
608 in the dissolution experiments, recalculated from the size ranges of the minerals. For most of
609 the minerals (apatite, quartz, albite, K-feldspar, and anorthite), the geometric surfaces are
610 within the same order of magnitude as the BET surfaces, even if often slightly lower (table 3).
611 However, as the BET surfaces are determined with fairly large uncertainties, especially for low
612 BET surfaces (up to $\pm 70\%$), and as they can be very different depending on the gas used (up
613 to 50% of difference between N₂ or Kr absorption; Brantley and Mellott, 2000), the above
614 differences between the geometrical and the BET surfaces cannot be considered significant
615 for the majority of minerals used in the Strengbach simulations. A significant difference only
616 appears for biotite, with the geometric surfaces one order of magnitude less than the BET
617 surfaces (table 3). However, for biotite, due to its layered structure, it has been shown that
618 approximately 80 – 90% of the surface area accessible by the gases used to estimate BET
619 surfaces is not accessible for weathering reactions (Nagy, 1995).

620 The above considerations explain why for a granitic bedrock as found in the Strengbach
621 catchment, the geometric surfaces are relevant to describe the surfaces of water-rock
622 interactions at the space and time scales of this study. An immediate corollary is that the
623 values of the standard kinetic constants (table EA12) are also appropriate to calculate reaction
624 rates with mineral geometric surfaces in our modeling approach. This ability may be related
625 to the fact that all the minerals that have been used in the dissolution experiments and in the
626 kinetic studies were collected in the field (e.g., Acker and Bricker, 1992; Amrhein and Suarez,
627 1992). These minerals were likely affected by anisotropy, passivation layers, and any types of
628 aging effects related to long-term water-rock interactions. Our results might therefore mean
629 that the standard kinetic constants obtained in such experiments integrate the aging effects
630 that have affected the reactivity of the primary minerals in natural environments. This would
631 explain why it is possible to capture the full variability of the water chemistry in a headwater
632 catchment with simple geometric reactive surfaces and standard kinetic constants.

633 At this stage, the results of our simulations strengthen the idea that the low surfaces
634 calculated from the geometrical shapes of minerals provide good estimates of the reactive
635 surfaces within this type of environment (Brantley and Mellott, 2000; Gautier et al., 2001;
636 White and Brantley, 2003; Zhu, 2005; Li et al., 2017). They are certainly the values to be used
637 for hydrogeochemical modeling such as that performed in this work, in addition to the use of
638 the experimental kinetic constants for mineral dissolution. These conclusions are certainly not
639 specific to the Strengbach catchment and could be applicable to many other headwater
640 granitic catchments.

641 **6-2 Implications for the acquisition of the water chemistry**

642 The results of the NIHM-KIRMAT hydrogeochemical modeling have strong implications
643 regarding the hydrogeochemical dynamic of the Strengbach watershed. This work reinforces
644 several hypotheses formulated by previous studies conducted in the Strengbach watershed
645 (Viville et al., 2012; Pierret et al., 2014; Pan et al., 2015; Chabaux et al., 2017; Weill et al., 2017;
646 Ackerer et al., 2018), but also brings new insights on the hydrogeochemical functioning of the
647 catchment. Firstly, the modeling results emphasize the importance of water transit times
648 within the watershed as a main feature controlling the chemical composition of subsurface
649 waters. Along all the slopes, the waters coming from the vicinity of the crests and
650 characterized by long transit times systematically render higher concentrations than the
651 waters with shorter pathways and transit times. When the hydrological conditions change
652 from wet to dry periods, the solute concentrations also tend to increase with the increase in
653 the mean transit time of waters. Our results show that for the spring and piezometer waters,
654 the spatial and temporal variations of their geochemical composition are fully explained by
655 the differences in water transit times (figure 13). Transit time variations between high and low
656 discharge periods explain the temporal variations of geochemical signatures within each site.
657 Various mean transit times of waters supplying the different sites explain the various chemical
658 compositions between the sites (figure 13). This key role of the water-rock interaction time is
659 in agreement with previous reactive-transport studies conducted in the Strengbach
660 watershed (Ackerer et al., 2018) and in other sites (e.g. Maher, 2010; Moore et al., 2012;
661 Lebedeva and Brantley; 2013).

662 This study also brings new constrains on the spatial distribution of the weathering processes.
663 For the modeling strategy employed, the chemical composition of the spring and piezometer
664 waters are calculated by integrating the chemical composition of waters introduced at
665 different starting locations along the active part of the flow lines (figure 5). The modeling

666 results show that through the geochemical integration, the concentrated waters coming from
667 the main crests are naturally counterbalanced by the diluted waters infiltrating close to the
668 sampling sites. The solute chemistry is acquired through reactions and weathering processes
669 that are spatially relatively homogenous along the flow lines of the watersheds. This spatial
670 homogeneity of the weathering processes helps us to understand why the chemical fluxes
671 carried by the Strengbach stream (Viville et al., 2012), the chemical fluxes from the Strengbach
672 spring waters (Ackerer et al., 2018) and the weathering fluxes locally determined along a
673 regolith profile sampled in the catchment (Ackerer et al., 2016), are all very similar.

674 The modeling also shows that the hydrogeochemical functioning of the watershed is properly
675 simulated by water circulations in the shallow subsurface, i.e., in a saprolitic aquifer. No
676 contribution of waters circulating in the deep fracture network of the granitic bedrock and
677 observed during the drilling campaigns (see Chabaux et al., 2017) is necessary. The deep-water
678 circulations are probably disconnected from the shallow subsurface network, as recently
679 suggested by geochemical studies conducted in the Strengbach watershed (Chabaux et al.,
680 2017; Pierret et al., 2018). This is also in agreement with recent hydrological modeling studies
681 arguing that the catchment behaves like a vertically thin but horizontally wide reservoir (Pan
682 et al., 2015; Weill et al., 2017). The modeling results also show that water in the shallow
683 aquifer flows along streamlines with fairly simple geometries. At the scale of the catchment
684 (figure 4), the geometry of the flow lines validates the hypothesis based on the geochemical
685 and Sr-U isotopic data that the spring waters of these mid-mountain basins are supplied by
686 waters from distinct flow paths without real interconnections (i.e., the Strengbach and
687 Ringelbach watersheds; Schaffhauser et al., 2014; Pierret et al., 2014). Flow paths are
688 therefore distinct along the slopes and occur within the shallow saprolitic aquifer but are not
689 controlled by deep fractures in the bedrock.

690 **6-3 Origins of general chemostatic behavior and of specific C-Q relations**

691 The hydrogeochemical monitoring of the spring, piezometer, and stream waters performed in
692 the Strengbach catchment clearly shows that this catchment has a general chemostatic
693 behavior (e.g., Viville et al., 2012; Ackerer et al., 2018). All the spring and the piezometer
694 waters have chemical concentrations impacted by changes in the hydrological conditions, but
695 the concentration variation ranges are by far narrower than variation ranges of water
696 discharges, which define the chemostatic behavior of a hydrological system. For waters
697 showing the largest concentration variations (spring CS1), there is a modest increase of
698 approximately 10-30% in the concentrations of H_4SiO_4 and Na^+ from floods to drought events,
699 while the water discharges may vary by a factor of 15 (figure 8). This modest variability of the
700 solute concentrations over a wide range of water discharges is not specific to the Strengbach
701 catchment; it has been observed in several watersheds spanning different climates and
702 hydrological contexts (Godsey et al., 2009; Clow and Mast, 2010; Kim et al., 2017).

703 Different origins for the chemostatic behavior have been proposed, such as a modification of
704 the mineral reactive surfaces during changing hydrological conditions (Clow and Mast, 2010),
705 a small concentration difference between slow and fast moving waters (Kim et al., 2017), or
706 the fact of reaching an equilibrium concentration along the water pathway (Maher, 2010). The
707 coupled approach NIHM-KIRMAT renews the opportunity to discuss on the origin of the
708 chemostatic behavior in catchments. It is worth noting that the acquisition and the evolution
709 of the water chemistry can be simulated along flow lines that have been determined via timely
710 and spatially distributed hydrological modeling. The strength of this approach is to constrain
711 water transit times independently and before any geochemical simulation.

712 The results from the hydrological model show that the characteristics of the flow lines are
713 affected by the changes in the hydrological conditions (section 4.2). This hydrological
714 functioning implies a covariation between flow velocity and flow length over changing
715 hydrological conditions, with faster flows along longer paths during wet conditions and slower
716 flows along shorter paths during dry periods. This hydrological behavior attenuates the
717 variations of the water transit times over changing hydrological conditions. It also explains
718 why the mean transit times span much narrower variation ranges than the water discharges
719 at the collected springs. For example, the calculated mean transit times of waters for the CS1
720 spring vary from 1.75 to 3.13 months between the strongest flood and the driest period that
721 have been studied, whereas the water discharges vary from 1.523 L/s to 0.098 L/s (figure 8B).
722 Because the time of the water-rock interactions exerts a first-order control on the chemical
723 composition of waters, the weak variability of the mean transit times is directly responsible
724 for the relative stability of the chemical composition of waters within the catchment.

725 In addition to this general chemostatic behavior, each chemical element has a specific
726 response to a change in water transit time as exemplified in figure 9 where are given the
727 concentration-mean transit time relations (C-MTT relations) for H_4SiO_4 and the major cations.
728 In the relevant transit time window for the spring and piezometer waters (figure 9b), the C-
729 MTT relations are linear and C-MTT slopes are significant for H_4SiO_4 , modest for Na^+ and weak
730 for Mg^{2+} and K^+ concentrations. The modeling results indicate that the C-MTT slopes are
731 controlled by the competition between primary mineral dissolution and element
732 incorporation into clay minerals. When elemental fluxes from primary mineral dissolution to
733 solution are much higher than fluxes from solution to clay minerals (e.g., H_4SiO_4), the element
734 can accumulate in solution, resulting in a significant C-MTT slope. By contrast, when elemental
735 fluxes from primary mineral dissolution to solution are only slightly higher than fluxes from

736 solution to clay minerals (e.g., K^+), the element accumulates only slowly in solution, resulting
737 in a weak C-MTT slope. Interestingly, when fitting power-laws along C-Q relations ($C=aQ^b$, in
738 caption of figure 8), both 'a' coefficient controlling the height of the C-Q laws and 'b'
739 coefficient controlling the curvature of the C-Q laws are sensitive to the C-MTT slopes (figure
740 9c and 9d). 'a' coefficient is positively correlated with C-MTT slopes while 'b' coefficient is
741 negatively correlated. Solute species with significant C-MTT slopes are more chemodynamic
742 and display higher mean annual concentrations (H_4SiO_4 , $b(H_4SiO_4)=-0.1$, $a(H_4SiO_4)=10^{-4}$),
743 whereas species with weak C-MTT slopes show low mean annual concentrations and are
744 nearly perfectly chemostatic ($a(Mg^{2+})=10^{-5}$, $b(Mg^{2+})=-0.016$, $a(K^+)=10^{-5}$, $b(K^+)=0$, figures 8, 9c
745 and 9d). Our results show that a better knowledge of C-MTT relations is important to explain
746 the contrasted C-Q shapes of chemical elements.

747 It is important to underline that the hydrological modeling with the NIHM code is performed
748 independently and before any geochemical simulations with the KIRMAT code. The fact that
749 the flow rates are well reproduced for all the hydrological contexts between 2010 and 2015
750 supports that the water transit times inferred from the NIHM code are realistic. The fact that
751 the chemical composition of waters is well captured indicates that the combination of the
752 geochemical parameters used in KIRMAT code is able to generate realistic reaction rates, as
753 chemistry is well reproduced while respecting realistic water transit times. No modifications
754 of the reactive surfaces and of the dissolution kinetic constants were necessary to reproduce
755 the seasonal variability of the water chemistry. It is also important to emphasize that the
756 simulated chemical compositions of waters remain far from a state of chemical equilibrium
757 with respect to primary minerals. The calculated Gibbs free energy for the primary minerals
758 ranges from -120 to -100 kJ/mol for apatite, -90 to -80 kJ/mol for biotite and anorthite and -
759 30 to -20 kJ/mol for albite and K-feldspar. These far-from-equilibrium values for the Gibbs free

760 energy imply that the reaction rates calculated using hydrogeochemical codes such as
761 KIRMAT, which are based on the transient state theory (TST, Eyring, 1935; Murphy and
762 Helgeson, 1987), are realistic for most of the primary minerals in this type of hydrological
763 context. Regarding the simulations performed in this study, the relatively short residence
764 times of waters and the precipitation of clay minerals prevent reaching a state of chemical
765 equilibrium between waters and primary minerals. Relying upon a clay solid solution is also
766 appropriate to mimic the clay mineral dynamic in this type of watershed, and a clay mineral
767 assemblage precipitating at thermodynamic equilibrium is able to generate reliable water
768 chemistry (this study) and realistic clay precipitation rates (more detail in Ackerer et al., 2018).

769 Our results indicate that it is not necessary to mix in different proportions soil and deep waters
770 to generate chemostatic behavior, as proposed by Zhi et al. (2019). Chemostatic behavior can
771 be generated within a single regolith layer with a homogeneous mineralogy, if as
772 demonstrated, the transit time variability of shallow subsurface waters is dampened by
773 seasonal fluctuations of flow line properties. A large storage of primary minerals and
774 weathering product in the subsurface, as proposed in Musolff et al. (2015), is required but not
775 sufficient to generate chemostatic behavior. Chemostatic behavior also depends on the
776 covariation between flow velocities and flow lengths over changing hydrological conditions.
777 Chemostatic behavior is not explained by a modification of the reactive-surface of minerals in
778 the subsurface (i.e., Clow and Mast, 2010), or by an absence of chemical contrast between
779 slow and rapid flows (i.e., Kim et al., 2017). The precipitation of clay minerals is essential to
780 correctly capture the water chemistry in our study, but the dissolution or redissolution of clays
781 is not a key process to explain chemostatic behavior (i.e., Li et al., 2017). Our study clearly
782 supports the idea defended by Herndon et al. (2018) that a spatial and temporal variability in
783 flow paths is a key process to explain C-Q relations **in this type of headwater catchment**. Our

784 conclusions can most likely be extended to the other mountainous and relatively steep
785 watersheds of this type, in which water pathways and short transit times are mainly controlled
786 by gravity driven flow along slopes (Weill et al., 2019).

787 **7- Conclusion**

788 This study exemplifies the potential of coupling of low-dimensional and depth-integrated
789 hydrological modeling with hydrogeochemical modeling as a way to better understand
790 variability over time and space of the composition of surface and subsurface waters. The
791 independent estimation of the water transit times provided by hydrological simulations is a
792 clear added value to constrain the geochemical modeling approaches. Our study
793 demonstrates that the seasonal variability of hydraulic conductivities along the slopes is a key
794 process to understand the dynamic of flow lines and the changes of water transit times in the
795 watershed. The variations in flow lines distributions from drought to flood events result in a
796 modest seasonal variability of mean water transit times, which in turn explains the relative
797 stability of the solute concentrations in waters. Our results also show that a better knowledge
798 of the concentration-mean transit time relations (C-MTT relations) is an interesting new step
799 to understand the diversity of C-Q shapes for different chemical elements. The consistency
800 between measured and modeled concentrations while respecting the water-rock interaction
801 times provided by the hydrological simulations shows that it is possible to capture the
802 chemical composition of waters with simply determined reactive surfaces and standard
803 kinetic constants. The results of our simulations strengthen the idea that the low surfaces
804 calculated from the geometrical shapes of minerals are a good estimate of the reactive
805 surfaces **in this type of granitic catchment**, and certainly the values to be used for
806 hydrogeochemical modeling such as that performed in this work, in addition to the use of the
807 experimental kinetic constants for mineral dissolution.

808

809 **Acknowledgements:** This work and the Julien Ackerer's salary were financially supported by
810 the French ANR Program (Project CANTARE- Alsace) under grant agreement ANR-15-CE06-
811 0014. This work also benefited from fruitful discussions with D. Daval. The authors thank all
812 the reviewers for their constructive comments that improved the quality of the manuscript.

813

814 **Bibliography**

- 815 Acker, J. G. and Bricker, O. P.: The influence of pH on biotite dissolution and alteration kinetics at low
816 temperature. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 56(8), 3073-3092, 1992.
- 817 Ackerer, J., Chabaux, F., Van der Woerd, J., Viville, D., Pelt, E., Kali, E., Lerouge, C., Ackerer, P., Di Chiara
818 Roupert, R. and Négrel, P.: Regolith evolution on the millennial timescale from combined U–
819 Th–Ra isotopes and in situ cosmogenic ¹⁰Be analysis in a weathering profile (Strengbach
820 catchment, France). *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 453, 33-43, 2016.
- 821 Ackerer, J., Chabaux, F., Lucas, Y., Clément, A., Fritz, B., Beaulieu, E Viville D., Pierret, M.C., Gangloff, S.
822 and Négrel, P.: Monitoring and reactive-transport modeling of the spatial and temporal
823 variations of the Strengbach spring hydrochemistry. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 225, 17-35,
824 2018.
- 825 Ameli, A. A., Beven, K., Erlandsson, M., Creed, I. F., McDonnell, J. J. and Bishop, K.: Primary weathering
826 rates, water transit times, and concentration-discharge relations: A theoretical analysis for the
827 critical zone. *Water Resour. Res.*, 53, 942-960, 2017.
- 828 Amrhein, C. and Suarez, D. L.: Some factors affecting the dissolution kinetics of anorthite at 25 C,
829 *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 56, 1815-1826, 1992.
- 830 Bao, C., Li, L., Shi, Y., & Duffy, C.: Understanding watershed hydrogeochemistry: 1. Development of RT-
831 Flux-PIHM. *Water Resources Research*, 53, 2328-2345, 2017.
- 832 Beaulieu, E., Goddérés, Y., Donnadiou, Y., Labat, D. and Roelandt, C.: High sensitivity of the continental-
833 weathering carbon dioxide sink to future climate change, *Nature Climate Change*, 2, 346, 2012.
- 834 Beaulieu, E., Lucas, Y., Viville, D., Chabaux, F., Ackerer, P., Goddérés, Y. and Pierret, M. C. : Hydrological
835 and vegetation response to climate change in a forested mountainous catchment, *Modeling*
836 *Earth Systems and Environment*, 2, 191, 2016.
- 837 Beisman, J. J., Maxwell, R. M., Navarre-Sitchler, A. K., Steefel, C. I., & Molins, S. ParCrunchFlow: an
838 efficient, parallel reactive transport simulation tool for physically and chemically

839 heterogeneous saturated subsurface environments. *Computational Geosciences*, 19, 403-422,
840 2015.

841 Berger, G., Cadore, E., Schott, J. and Dove, P. M.: Dissolution rate of quartz in lead and sodium
842 electrolyte solutions between 25 and 300 C: Effect of the nature of surface complexes and
843 reaction affinity, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 58, 541-551, 1994.

844 Brantley, S. L. and Mellott, N. P.: Surface area and porosity of primary silicate minerals, *Am. Mineral.*,
845 85, 1767-1783, 2000.

846 Camporese, M., Paniconi, C., Putti, M. and Orlandini, S.: Surface-subsurface flow modeling with path-
847 based runoff routing, boundary condition-based coupling, and assimilation of multisource
848 observation data, *Water Resour. Res.* 46, W02512, doi:10.1029/2008WR007536, 2010.

849 Chabaux, F., Viville, D., Lucas, Y., Ackerer, J., Ranchoux, C., Bosia, C, Pierret, M.C., Labasque, T.,
850 Aquilina, L., Wyns, R., Lerouge, C., Dezaye, C. and Négrel, P.: Geochemical tracing and modeling
851 of surface and deep water–rock interactions in first-order granitic watersheds (Strengbach and
852 Ringelbach CZOs, France), *Acta Geochim.*, 36, 363-366, 2017.

853 Chabaux F., Stille P., Prunier J., Gangloff S., Lemarchand D., Morvan G., Négrel J., Pelt E., Pierret M.C.,
854 Rihs S., Schmitt A.D., Trémoilières T., Viville D. Plant-soil-water interactions: Implications from
855 U-Th-Ra isotope analysis in soils, soil solutions and vegetation (Strengbach CZO, France).
856 *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 2019.

857 Chorover, J., Derry, L. A., & McDowell, W. H.: Concentration-Discharge Relations in the Critical Zone:
858 Implications for Resolving Critical Zone Structure, Function, and Evolution. *Water Resources*
859 *Research*, 53, 8654-8659, 2017.

860 Chou, L., and Wollast, R.: Steady-state kinetics and dissolution mechanisms of albite. *Am. J. Science*,
861 285, 963-993, 1985.

862 Clow, D. W. and Mast, M. A.: Mechanisms for chemostatic behavior in catchments: implications for
863 CO₂ consumption by mineral weathering, *Chem. Geol.*, 269, 40-51, 2010.

864 Diamond, J. S., & Cohen, M. J.: Complex patterns of catchment solute–discharge relationships for
865 coastal plain rivers. *Hydrological processes*, 32, 388-401, 2018.

866 Daval, D., Calvaruso, C., Guyot, F. and Turpault, M. P.: Time-dependent feldspar dissolution rates
867 resulting from surface passivation: Experimental evidence and geochemical implications. *Earth*
868 *Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 498, 226-236, 2018.

869 Ebel, B. A. and Loague, K.: Physics-based hydrologic-response simulation: Seeing through the fog of
870 equifinality. *Hydrological Processes: An International Journal*, 20, 2887-2900, 2006.

871 Eyring, H. The activated complex in chemical reactions. *The Journal of Chemical Physics*, 3, 107-115,
872 1935.

873 Fichter, J., Turpault, M. P., Dambrine, E. and Ranger, J.: Mineral evolution of acid forest soils in the
874 Strengbach catchment (Vosges mountains, NE France), *Geoderma*, 82, 315-340, 1998.

875 Fischer, C., Kurganskaya, I., Schäfer, T. and Lüttge, A.: Variability of crystal surface reactivity: What do
876 we know?, *Applied Geochem.* 43, 132-157, 2014.

877 Gangloff, S., Stille, P., Schmitt, A.D. and Chabaux F.: Factors controlling the chemical composition of
878 colloidal and dissolved fractions in soil solutions and the mobility of trace elements in soils,
879 *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 189 37–57, 2016.

880 Gangloff, S., Stille, P., Pierret, M. C., Weber, T. and Chabaux, F. : Characterization and evolution of
881 dissolved organic matter in acidic forest soil and its impact on the mobility of major and trace
882 elements (case of the Strengbach watershed), *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 130, 21-41, 2014.

883 Gautier, J. M., Oelkers, E. H. and Schott, J.: Are quartz dissolution rates proportional to BET surface
884 areas?, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 65, 1059-1070, 2001.

885 Gérard, F., Clément, A. and Fritz, B.: Numerical validation of a Eulerian hydrochemical code using a 1D
886 multisolute mass transport system involving heterogeneous kinetically controlled reactions, *J.*
887 *Cont. Hydrol.*, 30, 201-216, 1998.

888 Gh'Mari, E. : *Etude minéralogique, pétrophysique et géochimique de dynamique d'altération d'un*
889 *granite soumis aux dépôts atmosphériques acides (bassin versant du Strengbach, Vosges,*

890 France). *Mécanismes, bilans et modélisation*, PhD Thesis,, Université Louis Pasteur, Strasbourg,
891 pp. 200.

892 Gislason, S. R., Oelkers, E. H., Eiriksdottir, E. S., Kardjilov, M. I., Gisladottir, G., Sigfusson, B., Snorrason,
893 A., Elefsen, S., Hardardottir, J., Torssander, P. and Oskarsson, N.: Direct evidence of the
894 feedback between climate and weathering, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 277, 213-222, 2009.

895 Goddérís, Y., François, L. M., Probst, A., Schott, J., Moncoulon, D., Labat, D. and Viville, D.: Modelling
896 weathering processes at the catchment scale: the WITCH numerical model, *Geochim.*
897 *Cosmochim. Acta* 70, 1128–1147, 2006.

898 Goddérís, Y., Brantley, S. L., François, L., Schott, J., Pollard, D., Déqué, M. and Dury, M.: Rates of
899 consumption of atmospheric CO₂ through the weathering of loess during the next 100 yr of
900 climate change, *Biogeosciences*, 10, 135-148, 2013.

901 Godsey, S. E., Kirchner, J. W., and Clow, D. W.: Concentration–discharge relationships reflect
902 chemostatic characteristics of US catchments. *Hydrological Processes: An International*
903 *Journal*, 23, 1844-1864, 2009.

904 Guidry, M. W. and Mackenzie, F. T.: Experimental study of igneous and sedimentary apatite
905 dissolution: control of pH, distance from equilibrium, and temperature on dissolution rates,
906 *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 67, 2949-2963, 2003.

907 Gunduz, O. and Aral, M. M.: River networks and groundwater flow: a simultaneous solution of a
908 coupled system, *J. Hydrol.*, 301, 216-234, 2005.

909 Gupta, H.V., Kling, H., Yilmaz, K.K., Martinez, G.F. Decomposition of the mean squared error and NSE
910 performance criteria: Implications for improving hydrological modelling. *J. Hydrol.* 377, 80–91,
911 2009.

912 Hazenberg, P., Broxton, P., Gochis, D., Niu, G. Y., Pangle, L. A., Pelletier, J. D., ... and Zeng, X. (2016).
913 Testing the hybrid-3-D hillslope hydrological model in a controlled environment, *Wat. Resour.*
914 *Res.*, 52, 1089-1107, 2016.

915 Herndon, E. M., Steinhoefel, G., Dere, A. L., & Sullivan, P. L.: Perennial flow through convergent
916 hillslopes explains chemodynamic solute behavior in a shale headwater catchment. *Chemical*
917 *Geology*, 493, 413-425, 2018.

918 Jeannot, B., Weill, S., Eschbach, D., Schmitt, L. and Delay, F.: A low-dimensional integrated subsurface
919 hydrological model coupled with 2-D overland flow: Application to a restored fluvial
920 hydrosystem (Upper Rhine River–France), *J. Hydrol.*, 563, 495-509, 2018.

921 Kampf, S. K. and Burges, S. J.: A framework for classifying and comparing distributed hillslope and
922 catchment hydrologic models, *Water Resour. Res.*, W05423, doi:10.1029/2006WR005370,
923 2007

924 Kim, H., Dietrich, W. E., Thurnhoffer, B. M., Bishop, J. K. and Fung, I. Y.: Controls on solute
925 concentration-discharge relationships revealed by simultaneous hydrochemistry observations
926 of hillslope runoff and stream flow: The importance of critical zone structure, *Water Resour.*
927 *Res.*, 53, 1424-1443, 2017.

928 Kirchner, J. W.: Getting the right answers for the right reasons: Linking measurements, analyses, and
929 models to advance the science of hydrology, *Water Resour. Res.* 42, W03S04,
930 doi:10.1029/2005WR004362, 2006.

931 Lebedeva, M. I. and Brantley, S. L. : Exploring geochemical controls on weathering and erosion of
932 convex hillslopes: Beyond the empirical regolith production function. *Earth Surface Processes*
933 *and Landforms*, 38, 1793-1807, 2013.

934 Li, D. D., Jacobson, A. D. and McInerney, D. J.: A reactive-transport model for examining tectonic and
935 climatic controls on chemical weathering and atmospheric CO₂ consumption in granitic
936 regolith. *Chem. Geol.*, 365, 30-42 2014.

937 Li, L., Peters, C. A. and Celia, M. A.: Upscaling geochemical reaction rates using pore-scale network
938 modeling. *Advances in water resources*, 29, 1351-1370, 2006.

939 Li, L., Bao, C., Sullivan, P. L., Brantley, S., Shi, Y., & Duffy, C. Understanding watershed
940 hydrogeochemistry: 2. Synchronized hydrological and geochemical processes drive stream
941 chemostatic behavior. *Water Resources Research*, 53, 2346-2367, 2017.

942 Li, L., Maher, K., Navarre-Sitchler, A., Druhan, J., Meile, C., Lawrence, C., ... and Jin, L. : Expanding the
943 role of reactive transport models in critical zone processes. *Earth-Science Reviews*, 165, 280-
944 301, 2017

945 Lucas, Y., Schmitt, A. D., Chabaux, F., Clément, A., Fritz, B., Elsass, P. and Durand, S.: Geochemical
946 tracing and hydrogeochemical modelling of water–rock interactions during salinization of
947 alluvial groundwater (Upper Rhine Valley, France), *Appl. Geochem.*, 25, 1644-1663, 2010.

948 Lucas, Y., Chabaux, F., Schaffhauser, T., Fritz, B., Ambroise, B., Ackerer, J. and Clément, A.:
949 Hydrogeochemical modeling (KIRMAT) of spring and deep borehole water compositions in the
950 small granitic Ringelbach catchment (Vosges Mountains, France), *Applied Geochemistry*, 87, 1-
951 21, 2017.

952 Lundström, U. and Öhman, L. O.: Dissolution of feldspars in the presence of natural, organic solutes,
953 *Journal of Soil Science*, 41, 359-369, 1990.

954 Maher, K., Steefel, C. I., White, A. F., & Stonestrom, D. A.: The role of reaction affinity and secondary
955 minerals in regulating chemical weathering rates at the Santa Cruz Soil Chronosequence,
956 California, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 73, 2804-2831, 2009.

957 Maher, K. : The dependence of chemical weathering rates on fluid residence time, *Earth Planet. Sci.*
958 *Lett.*, 294, 101-110, 2010.

959 Maher, K.: The role of fluid residence time and topographic scales in determining chemical fluxes from
960 landscapes, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 312, 48-58, 2011.

961 Mirus, B. B., Ebel, B. A., Heppner, C. S. and Loague, K.: Assessing the detail needed to capture rainfall-
962 runoff dynamics with physics-based hydrologic response simulation, *Water Resour. Res.*, 47,
963 W00H10, doi:10.1029/2010WR009906, 2011

964 Moore, J., Lichtner, P. C., White, A. F. and Brantley, S. L.: Using a reactive transport model to elucidate
965 differences between laboratory and field dissolution rates in regolith, *Geochim. Cosmochim.*
966 *Acta*, *93*, 235-261, 2012.

967 Murphy, W. M., & Helgeson, H. C. Thermodynamic and kinetic constraints on reaction rates among
968 minerals and aqueous solutions. III. Activated complexes and the pH-dependence of the rates
969 of feldspar, pyroxene, wollastonite, and olivine hydrolysis. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*,
970 *51*, 3137-3153, 1987.

971 Nagy, K. L., White, A. F., & Brantley, S. L. Chemical weathering rates of silicate minerals. *Mineralogical*
972 *Society of America. Washington. DC*. 1995.

973 Navarre-Sitchler, A. and Brantley, S.: Basalt weathering across scales, *Earth and Planet. Sci. Let.*, *261*,
974 321-334, 2007.

975 Navarre-Sitchler, A., Steefel, C. I., Yang, L., Tomutsa, L. and Brantley, S. L.: Evolution of porosity and
976 diffusivity associated with chemical weathering of a basalt clast, *Journal of Geophysical*
977 *Research: Earth Surface*, *114*, F02016, doi:10.1029/2008JF001060, 2009.

978 Ngo, V. V., Delalande, M., Clément, A., Michau, N. and Fritz, B.: Coupled transport-reaction modeling
979 of the long-term interaction between iron, bentonite and Callovo-Oxfordian claystone in
980 radioactive waste confinement systems., *Applied Clay Science*, *101*, 430-443, 2014

981 Pan, Y., Weill, S., Ackerer, P. and Delay, F.: A coupled stream flow and depth-integrated subsurface
982 flow model for catchment hydrology, *Journal of Hydrology*, *530*, 66-78, 2015

983 Pierret, M. C., Cotel, S., Ackerer, P., Beaulieu, E., Benarioumlil, S., Boucher, M., ... & Friedmann, P.:
984 The Strengbach catchment: A multidisciplinary environmental sentry for 30 years. *Vadose*
985 *Zone Journal*, *17*, 2018.

986 Pierret, M. C., Stille, P., Prunier, J., Viville, D., & Chabaux, F. Chemical and U–Sr isotopic variations in
987 stream and source waters of the Strengbach watershed (Vosges mountains, France).
988 *Hydrology and Earth System Sciences*, *18*, 2014.

989 Pollet-Villard, M., Daval, D., Ackerer, P., Saldi, G. D., Wild, B., Knauss, K. G. and Fritz, B.: Does
990 crystallographic anisotropy prevent the conventional treatment of aqueous mineral reactivity?
991 A case study based on K-feldspar dissolution kinetics, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, *190*, 294-
992 308, 2016.

993 Prunier, J., Chabaux, F., Stille, P., Gangloff, S., Pierret, M. C., Viville, D. and Aubert, A. : Geochemical
994 and isotopic (Sr, U) monitoring of soil solutions from the Strengbach catchment (Vosges
995 mountains, France): Evidence for recent weathering evolution, *Chem. Geol.*, *417*, 289-305,
996 2015.

997 Schaffhauser, T., Chabaux, F., Ambroise, B., Lucas, Y., Stille, P., Reuschlé, T., Perrone, T. and Fritz, B.:
998 Geochemical and isotopic (U, Sr) tracing of water pathways in the granitic Ringelbach
999 catchment (Vosges Mountains, France), *Chem. Geol.*, *374*, 117-127, 2014.

1000 Schmitt, A.D., Gangloff, S., Labolle, F., Chabaux, F. and Stille, P.: Ca biogeochemical cycle at the beech
1001 tree - soil solution interface from the Strengbach CZO (NE France): insights from stable Ca and
1002 radiogenic Sr isotopes, *Geochim. and Cosmochim. Acta* *213*, 91-109, 2017

1003 Schmitt AD, Borrelli N., Ertlen D., Gangloff S., Chabaux, F. and Osterrieth M.: Stable calcium isotope
1004 speciation and calcium oxalate production within beech tree (*Fagus sylvatica* L.) organs,
1005 *Biogeochemistry*, *137*,197-217, DOI 10.1007/s10533-017-0411-0, 2018.

1006 Steefel, C. I., DePaolo, D. J. and Lichtner, P. C.: Reactive transport modeling: An essential tool and a
1007 new research approach for the Earth sciences, *Earth Planet. Sci. Let.*, *240*, 539-558, 2005

1008 Tardy, Y. and Fritz, B.: An ideal solid solution model for calculating solubility of clay minerals, *Clay*
1009 *minerals*, *16*, 361-373, 1981.

1010 Viville, D., Chabaux, F., Stille, P., Pierret, M. C. and Gangloff, S.: Erosion and weathering fluxes in granitic
1011 basins: the example of the Strengbach catchment (Vosges massif, eastern France), *Catena*, *92*,
1012 122-129, 2012.

1013 Weill, S., Altissimo, M., Cassiani, G., Deiana, R., Marani, M. and Putti, M.: Saturated area dynamics and
1014 streamflow generation from coupled surface–subsurface simulations and field observations,
1015 *Advances in water resources*, 59, 196-208, 2013.

1016 Weill, S., Delay, F., Pan, Y. and Ackerer, P.: A low-dimensional subsurface model for saturated and
1017 unsaturated flow processes: ability to address heterogeneity, *Computational Geosciences*, 21,
1018 301-314, 2017.

1019 Weill, S., Lesparre, N., Jeannot, B., & Delay, F. Variability of Water Transit Time Distributions at the
1020 Strengbach Catchment (Vosges Mountains, France) Inferred Through Integrated Hydrological
1021 Modeling and Particle Tracking Algorithms. *Water*, 2637, 2019.

1022 White, A. F. and Brantley, S. L.: The effect of time on the weathering of silicate minerals: why do
1023 weathering rates differ in the laboratory and field?, *Chem. Geol.*, 202, 479-506, 2003.

1024 Wild, B., Daval, D., Guyot, F., Knauss, K. G., Pollet-Villard, M. and Imfeld, G.: pH-dependent control of
1025 feldspar dissolution rate by altered surface layers, *Chemical Geology*, 442, 148-159, 2016.

1026 Zhi, W., Li, L., Dong, W., Brown, W., Kaye, J., Steefel, C., & Williams, K. H. Distinct Source Water
1027 Chemistry Shapes Contrasting Concentration-Discharge Patterns. *Water Resources Research*.
1028 2019.

1029 Zhu, C.: In situ feldspar dissolution rates in an aquifer, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 69, 1435-1453,
1030 2005.

1031

1032

1033 **Figure and table captions**

1034 Figure 1: sampling locations within the Strengbach catchment. Blue stars represent springs,
1035 blue diamonds represent piezometers, and the blue circle represents the stream at the outlet
1036 of the watershed. Green circles represent soil solution locations, and black diamonds
1037 represent bedrock facies locations.

1038 Figure 2: on the left: calibrated field of thicknesses of the weathered material constituting the
1039 shallow unconfined aquifer at the Strengbach catchment used for the simulations by NIHM.
1040 The 1D surface draining network used in NIHM is represented by the black lines. The mesh for
1041 the groundwater compartment is represented by grey lines. On the right: fitting observed flow
1042 rates from the Strengbach stream at the outlet of the catchment with simulations of flow
1043 within the watershed (illustrated from 2010 to 2015). The subsurface compartment inherits
1044 from the aquifer thicknesses reported in the left panel, and the topography lets the natural
1045 outlet of the subsurface compartment being the surface draining network.

1046 Figure 3: principle of the method of backtracking used to determine flow lines that generate
1047 flow at the outlet of the Strengbach catchment. Particles are dispatched along the wet fraction
1048 of the 1D river network (only one is represented here at a position a on 01/01/2010 at 23:59).
1049 NIHM generates an output heterogeneous velocity field at that date for the whole watershed,
1050 denoted $V_{01/01/2010}$. By using a velocity field of the same magnitude but opposite direction to
1051 the particle, the position of the particle is backtracked until 31/12/2009 23:59. Then, to further
1052 backtrack the trajectory of the particle, the velocity field is updated accordingly. The
1053 frequency of velocity field updates is set to one day.

1054

1055 Figure 4: at the top, flow lines of the subsurface that feed with water the surface draining
1056 network on March 1st, 2010 (on the left, high-flow period) and July 1st, 2010 (on the right, low-
1057 flow period). The color scale indicates that a water particle reaching the river at a given date
1058 started its travel along the streamline or passed at a given location on the streamline x days
1059 prior. The density of streamlines is associated with the flowing versus dry fraction of the river
1060 network at a prescribed date. Below, flow lines of the subsurface that feed with water the
1061 geochemical sampling sites on March 30th, 2010 (on the left, flood event) and November 29th,
1062 2011 (right, drought event) according to NIHM simulations. For each sampling site, 10 particles
1063 were dispatched in the direct neighborhood of the site and then backtracked to render 10
1064 stream lines. The color scale for times is similar to that of the top plot.

1065 Figure 5: conceptual scheme used in the modeling of the water chemistry. The soil solutions
1066 are used as input solution. Cells represent the grid of the reactive-transport code KIRMAT. The
1067 regolith is discretized into a 1D succession of cells along the active parts of the flow lines
1068 determined by the NIHM hydrological model. The hydrogeochemical model KIRMAT evaluates
1069 transport and geochemical processes within each cell. The integrated chemistry of sampled
1070 waters is the arithmetic mean of solute concentrations with regularly distributed inlet points
1071 along a stream line.

1072 Figure 6: maps of piezometric gradient and depth-integrated hydraulic conductivity for the
1073 Strengbach catchment, as simulated by NIHM, on 29/11/2011 (dry period) and 30/03/2010
1074 (high flows period). The mean hydraulic conductivity is integrated normal to bedrock of the
1075 aquifer and thus depends on the water saturation of the vadose zone and the location of the
1076 water table.

1077 Figure 7: simulation results for the CS1 spring for an important drought (29/11/2011) and a
1078 strong flood event (30/03/2010). At the top, active parts of the flow lines bringing the waters
1079 to the CS1 spring for the two sampling dates (7A and 7B). Below, simulated chemical
1080 compositions of CS1 spring waters after integration along the flow lines and comparison with
1081 the initial soil solution and the spring chemistry data (7C and 7D). Error bars show analytical
1082 uncertainties on measured concentrations and induced uncertainties in model results (the
1083 propagation in the KIRMAT simulations of analytical uncertainties from pH and chemical
1084 concentrations measured in the soil solutions).

1085 Figure 8: simulation results for the CS1 spring over the whole range of the water discharges
1086 from the spring. Results are presented for H_4SiO_4 , Na^+ , K^+ and Mg^{2+} concentrations (8A, 8C, 8E
1087 and 8F), pH (8D) and mean water transit time (8B). Red lines indicate simulated parameters
1088 after integration along the flow lines, and blue points show measured values collected
1089 between 2005 and 2015. Corresponding dates and data for the modeled samples are given in
1090 table 1. The overall geochemical database is available in supplementary table EA1. Error bars
1091 show analytical uncertainties on measured concentrations and induced uncertainties in model
1092 results (the propagation in the KIRMAT simulations of analytical uncertainties from pH and
1093 chemical concentrations measured in the soil solutions). Fitting a power law of type $C=a*Q^b$
1094 along the C-Q relations gives the following parameters: $a(\text{H}_4\text{SiO}_4)=10^{-4}$, $b(\text{H}_4\text{SiO}_4)=-0.1$;
1095 $a(\text{Na}^+)=7\times 10^{-5}$, $b(\text{Na}^+)=-0.053$; $a(\text{Mg}^{2+})=10^{-5}$, $b(\text{Mg}^{2+})=-0.016$; $a(\text{K}^+)=10^{-5}$, $b(\text{K}^+)=0$.

1096 Figure 9: (9A) evolution of solute concentrations for H_4SiO_4 , Na^+ , K^+ , Mg^{2+} and Ca^{2+} as a function
1097 of mean water transit time in the Strengbach watershed. Water transit times are between
1098 1.75 and 4 months for all the springs and piezometers in this study. (9B) Focus on the transit
1099 time window (1.75-4 months) for the studied waters and equations linking mean water transit

1100 times and concentrations for H_4SiO_4 , Na^+ , K^+ , Mg^{2+} and Ca^{2+} . Relations between transit times
1101 and concentrations are linear within this window (9C) relations between 'b' coefficients
1102 ($C=a*Q^b$) and the concentration-transit time slopes for the chemical elements. (9D) relations
1103 between 'a' coefficients ($C=a*Q^b$) and the concentration-transit time slopes for the chemical
1104 elements. Elements with significant concentration-mean transit time slopes are slightly
1105 chemodynamic (e.g. H_4SiO_4 and Na^+), while elements with low concentration-mean transit
1106 time slopes are almost chemostatic in the watershed (e.g. K^+ and Mg^{2+}). Ca^{2+} is not shown on
1107 9C and 9D figures as this element is affected by a strong multi-annual concentration decrease
1108 that prevents a meaningful C-Q power law analysis (Ackerer et al., 2018).

1109 Figure 10: simulation results for the PZ3 and PZ5 piezometers for a flood event (05/05/2015).
1110 At the top, active parts of the flow lines that bring waters to the two sampling sites (10A and
1111 10B). Below, simulated chemical compositions of the piezometer waters after integration
1112 along the flow lines and comparison with the initial soil solution and the water chemistry data
1113 (10C and 10D). Error bars show analytical uncertainties on measured concentrations and
1114 induced uncertainties in model results (the propagation in the KIRMAT simulations of
1115 analytical uncertainties from pH and chemical concentrations measured in the soil solutions).

1116 Figure 11: simulation results for the CS2 spring. At the top, active parts of the flow lines that
1117 bring water to the CS2 spring for drought (29/11/2011) and flood (30/03/2010) events (11A
1118 and 11B). The CS2 location results in more scattered flow lines than for CS1 spring. Below,
1119 simulation results for the CS2 spring over the whole range of experienced discharges (11C and
1120 11D). Blue lines indicate simulated parameters after integration along the slowest flow line,
1121 yellow lines indicate simulated parameters after integration along the fastest flow line, and
1122 blue points show measured values collected between 2005 and 2015 (data in table 1 and in

1123 supplementary table EA2). Error bars show analytical uncertainties on measured
1124 concentrations and induced uncertainties in model results (the propagation in the KIRMAT
1125 simulations of analytical uncertainties from pH and chemical concentrations measured in the
1126 soil solutions).

1127 Figure 12: simulation results for the RH3 spring chemistry and for a flood event (30/03/2010).
1128 Left, simulated concentrations by assuming flow lines running through gneiss (GN) only (12A).
1129 Right, simulated concentrations by assuming flow lines running through hydrothermally
1130 altered granite (VS) only (12B). Error bars show analytical uncertainties on measured
1131 concentrations and induced uncertainties in model results (the propagation in the KIRMAT
1132 simulations of analytical uncertainties from pH and chemical concentrations measured in the
1133 soil solutions).

1134 Figure 13: overview of the simulated flow lines in the subsurface that feed with water the
1135 geochemical sampling sites CS1, PZ3, and PZ5 on May 5th, 2015. The simulated chemical
1136 compositions after geochemical integration along the flow lines are compared with the initial
1137 soil solution and the spring chemistry data.

1138 Table 1: measured pH, water discharges and chemical concentrations of H_4SiO_4 , Na^+ , K^+ , Mg^{2+} ,
1139 and Ca^{2+} in water samples collected at the Strengbach catchment and used for the
1140 hydrogeochemical modeling. The sampling sites include springs (CS1, CS2, RH3) and
1141 piezometers (PZ3, PZ5).

1142 Table 2: Initial and calibrated values of the hydrodynamic parameters of the aquifer in the
1143 hydrological simulation of the Strengbach catchment by NIHM.

1144 Table 3: Comparison between BET surfaces and geometric surfaces for the major primary
1145 minerals present in a granitic context. BET surfaces were measured via gas absorption

1146 experiments by ¹Berger et al., 1994; ²Chou and Wollast, 1985; ³Lundstrom and Ohman, 1990;
1147 ⁴Amrhein and Suarez, 1992; ⁵Acker and Bricker, 1992; and ⁶Guidry and Mackenzie, 2003.
1148 Geometric surfaces were recalculated from the granulometric ranges of the minerals and by
1149 assuming a spherical geometry.