

Interactive comment on “Field-based groundwater recharge and leakage estimations in a semi-arid Eastern Mediterranean karst catchment, Wadi Natuf, West Bank” by Clemens Messerschmid et al.

O. Batelaan (Referee)

okke.batelaan@flinders.edu.au

Received and published: 3 August 2018

Review: Field-based groundwater recharge and leakage estimations in a semi-arid Eastern Mediterranean karst catchment, Wadi Natuf, West Bank. Messerschmid et al. I have mixed feelings about this paper. In principle the broader background problem/issue (spatial/temporal recharge estimation of semi-arid mountainous areas) of this paper is interesting and important. Water management in the study area is also a big issue, hence the topic of the paper is good. Further, it is commendable that this paper aims and is based on extensively collected field data. However, the introduc-

C1

tion, presentation of the data, methods, results is far from mature. The paper needs a big overhaul of its structure (i.e. where in the paper is presented what), the logic and analysis support, and finally a detailed and broader discussion linking it to state of research in this field of research. I got several times confused or could not follow the argumentation, a lot of work will have to go into making the text a lot more clearer. Moreover, the used terminology is often not very precise. It is difficult from the many tables to grasp the significant points. The figures and the captions could be improved, potentially more figures in stead of tables could help to clarify the paper.

I have provided in an attached marked up version of the paper many more general and detailed comments.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/hess-2018-329/hess-2018-329-RC3-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2018-329>, 2018.

C2