Hydrology and
Earth System
Sciences
Discussions

Interactive comment on "The CAMELS-CL dataset: catchment attributes and meteorology for large sample studies – Chile dataset" *by* Camila Alvarez-Garreton et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 23 April 2018

The paper describes a new dataset of catchment attributes for Chile, as well as a short analysis using this dataset. The dataset itself should be very useful to those studying hydrology in the area. Similar datasets in other regions have proven to be enormously useful and widely used. The paper provides a good description of the attributes included in the dataset. In addition, the analysis provides a good overview of hydrologic and land use conditions in Chile, with a few observations about correlation between different variables.

A few more specific comments:

- In the description of water rights, many different types of water use are mentioned.

Are there types or amounts of water use that do not require a permitted water right? (For example, below a threshold amount?)

- There is a missing band of elevation between 1000 m.a.s.l. and 3500 m.a.s.l, if I understand the categorizations described in 4.1 correctly. Why is this?

- Section 5 and 6: be careful to be precise in the wording so as not to confuse correlation and causation. (See sentences page 17, line 16; page 28, line 29)

- Throughout the paper, there are a number of small grammatical issues that could be improved by a close reading.

I recommend publication of this paper as a means of making this dataset available and as a demonstration of its utility, provided this type of paper is within the scope of HESS. Note that the analysis portion of this paper is not extensive.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2018-23, 2018.