Hydrology and Earth System Sciences

Discussions

HESSD

Interactive
comment

Interactive comment on "Potential of seasonal hydrological forecasting of monthly run-off volumes for the Rhone and Arve Rivers from April to July" *by* Oriane Etter et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 26 April 2018

Review

This paper presents some interesting forecast examples, but I doubt it is suitable for HESS for the following reasons:

- The writing is very unclear. What is written often does not make sense. I recommend that a native speaker checks the entire manuscript. - It is unclear what the real novel contribution is of this paper. I would expect statements in the abstract or conclusion that would make the scientific contribution of this paper clear. Instead, I only read details about how models have performed, without any context of what we actually learn from these results, and how that improves our knowledge compared to before

this manuscript was written. I also do not see how there are any clear significant methodological advances. - The methods section mixes methods and results, and data. - The study domain section provides results - Similar to the previous reviewer: details about the used model are insufficient and from the reading of the paper I have no idea what model is actually used in the end. I cannot reproduce any of the methods. - Please provide figure captions that actually explain the figure. - I agree with the previous reviewer that given the quality of this manuscript I cannot provide a full review of the content presented in this paper.

Sorry I cannot be more positive about this paper, but I fail to see how it can become an appropriate contribution to HESS.

———————————————

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2018-119, 2018.