

***Interactive comment on* “Minimum dissipation of potential energy by groundwater outflow results in a simple linear catchment reservoir” by Axel Kleidon and Hubert H J. Savenije**

B. Biswal

basudev02@gmail.com

Received and published: 9 December 2017

The work by the authors is quite interesting. However, the main premise that catchments behave as linear reservoirs needs to be properly reinforced.

It is claimed that large catchments behave as linear reservoirs although hill-slopes and small catchments behave as non-linear reservoirs (line 5). However, many recent studies have shown that large catchments generally behave as non-linear system (e.g., Biswal and Marani, 2010; Shaw and Riha, 2012; Mutzner et al., 2013; Biswal and Nagesh Kumar, 2014; Ben Krewajski, 2016). At least a through discussion on this subject is needed.

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



Cannot the concept of "minimum dissipation of potential energy" explain catchment non-linearity?

References:

Biswal, B., & Marani, M. (2010). Geomorphological origin of recession curves. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 37(24).

Biswal, B., & Kumar, D. N. (2014). What mainly controls recession flows in river basins?. *Advances in Water Resources*, 65, 25-33.

Chen, B., & Krajewski, W. (2016). Analysing individual recession events: sensitivity of parameter determination to the calculation procedure. *Hydrological Sciences Journal*, 61(16), 2887-2901.

Mutzner, R., Bertuzzo, E., Tarolli, P., Weijs, S. V., Nicotina, L., Ceola, S., ... & Rinaldo, A. (2013). Geomorphic signatures on Brutsaert base flow recession analysis. *Water Resources Research*, 49(9), 5462-5472.

Shaw, S. B., & Riha, S. J. (2012). Examining individual recession events instead of a data cloud: Using a modified interpretation of $dQ/dt-Q$ streamflow recession in glaciated watersheds to better inform models of low flow. *Journal of hydrology*, 434, 46-54.

Interactive comment on *Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss.*, <https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2017-674>, 2017.

HESSD

Interactive
comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

