Interactive comment on "From Engineering Hydrology to Earth System Science: Milestones in the Transformation of Hydrologic Science" *by* Murugesu Sivapalan

K. J. Beven (Referee)

k.beven@lancaster.ac.uk

As noted in the acknowledgements I have already seen and commented on an earlier version of this paper. I do not agree with everything that is in the paper - Siva and I have been happily arguing for more than 30 years - but I do think it is an excellent summary of Siva's thought. In addition it is an invited paper arising out of the Wegener lecture so can essentially be considered a statement of his opinions. So the only comments I would make are some queries about the referencing (see attached mss) and to query whether the Wegener figure is really necessary (the concept is well known and it does not actually have any dots being connected).

k

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
https://www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/hess-2017-670/hess-2017-670-RC1-supplement.pdf