

Interactive comment on “Seasonal streamflow forecasts in the Ahlergaarde catchment, Denmark: effect of preprocessing and postprocessing on skill and statistical consistency” by Diana Lucatero et al.

M. Zappa (Referee)

massimiliano.zappa@wsl.ch

Received and published: 29 August 2017

Dear authors,

This paper is a nice well designed study on pre- and post-processed seasonal ensemble predictions. Such studies are needed to learn the limits and opportunities yielded by such prediction systems.

In some parts the referencing and discussion suffers from the fact that a com-

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



panion paper dealing with the meteorological pre-processing is also in revision. The authors should better state that there is a companion paper and therefore some aspects concerning meteorology are not dealt here.

While it is nice to have a study dealing with both pre- and post-processing. The applied methodologies (mainly for the post-processing) are rather simple as compared to state-of-the-art methods. The authors should give more room on the discussion of their findings with respect to findings obtained by "higher-order" post-processing techniques.

The issue of having in some cases 15 and in other cases 51 members should be addressed also in the results and discussion sections. SI give in the commented manuscript a reference to have a look at.

The discussion section should be extended and separated from the conclusions.

I am sure that the authors can accommodate my requests prior to publication of this study.

Best regards

Massimiliano Zappa

Please note my comments in the attached PDF of your original manuscript.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/hess-2017-379/hess-2017-379-RC3-supplement.pdf>

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2017-379>, 2017.

HESD

Interactive
comment

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)

