

Interactive comment on “Reliability of meteorological drought indices for predicting soil moisture droughts” by D. Halwatura et al.

Dr. Teuling (Referee)

ryan.teuling@wur.nl

Received and published: 3 November 2016

Over the past few week, I have supervised three students that reviewed this manuscript as part of their MSc programme. They have submitted their reports individually, but my own assessment largely overlaps with their assessments. Hence, I will not redo their work, and hope the editor will use their reports instead. In summary, I find the comparison between standardized drought indices (i.e. based on a seasonally varying threshold) and what can be referred to as dryness indices (i.e. pF) poorly motivated at best. Why should these two be correlated, and if they are, what is the reason for this? Based on the arguments provided by my students, I believe this manuscript needs major revisions, including at least new analysis on standardized pF values.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., doi:10.5194/hess-2016-467, 2016.