

Interactive comment on “Identifying water deficit and vegetation response during the 2009/10 drought over North China: Implications for the South-to-North Water Diversion project” by B. Zhu et al.

J. Seibert (Editor)

jan.seibert@geo.uzh.ch

Received and published: 12 October 2016

Both reviewers have major concerns with the manuscript and raise a list of issues ranging from needs to clarify the presentation to more substantial questions on the used approaches. Altogether, addressing these issues will require substantial major revisions. The methods and used data were rather unclear, which means that the reviewers only partly were able to assess what exactly has been done. The revised manuscript will have to address all these comments. The replies by the authors were difficult to read due to the lack of paragraphs. As far as I can see the authors provide

C1

some way forward to address the reviewers' concerns, although some replies, such as to reviewer 2 comment 3, were not fully convincing. Here certainly more efforts by the authors are needed.

As a small but important additional note: in figure 1 islands south of China are included. These are disputed borders and as there are from the content of the manuscript/figure no need to include these islands, I'd ask you to remove the inset in the map of figure 1. (see <http://www.nature.com/nature/journal/v478/n7369/pdf/478285a.pdf>)

Best regards,

Jan Seibert

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., doi:10.5194/hess-2016-313, 2016.

C2