

Interactive comment on “Is groundwater sufficient to support sustainable irrigation agriculture in a reclaimed wetland region?” by Z. Pang et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 12 July 2016

The paper is a case study of the agriculturally used Sanjiang plain. While the paper presents some interesting data I do not support publication for a number of reasons. The paper presents a very large amount of data, but the goal of this research remains unclear until the end. The introduction highlights that the goal of the paper is to understand “the implications of sustainable irrigation agriculture” (implications on what? Sustainable in terms of what?) as well as the “factors controlling groundwater regime”. These goals are fairly unspecific, and I do not think they have been achieved in the study. For example, stable isotopes are widely used in the section recharge to aquifers, but there is not a single estimate of recharge rates. The same is true for the residence times. To be publishable, I suggest that the research questions are much more specific, and that the data are used for a quantitative interpretation. Right now the paper reads like a long and somewhat random collection of data without too much

C1

quantitative substance or research context.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., doi:10.5194/hess-2016-155, 2016.

C2