Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., doi:10.5194/hess-2015-551-RC3, 2016 © Author(s) 2016. CC-BY 3.0 License.



HESSD

Interactive comment

Interactive comment on "Comparison of satellite based evapotranspiration estimates over the Tibetan Plateau" by J. Peng et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 23 February 2016

Comments from one reviewer

In this work, the authors explored six available ET products based on different approaches to provide a detailed cross comparison over the Tibetan Plateau. The results are interesting, which all products capture well the seasonal variability. Moreover, regarding the spatial pattern, the High Resolution Land Surface Parameters form Space (HOLAPS) ET demonstrator dataset agrees best with LandFlux-EVAL dataset (a benchmark ET product from the Global Energy and Water Cycle Experiment). It is useful to use the HOLAPS dataset to understand the land-atmosphere-biosphere interaction over the Tibetan Plateau. Although the manuscript is written fluently, the quality of the English language and grammar needs further improvement. Thus, I recommend the manuscript to be accepted by the journal after some minor revisions. Specific comments: "Figure 1: Map of the location and topography of the Tibetan Plateau, and



Discussion paper



four sub-regions used in this study." Question: Why and how divide TP into four subregions? Please provide scientific evidence. Methods: The manuscript would benefit of further descriptions of the related methods. Discussion: The discussion seems missing and the results with an attempt of discussion. The discussion need to be fully revised and expanded.

Line 34ïijŽ"and-atmosphere-biosphere". SuggestionïijŽland-atmosphere-biosphere. Lines 46-48ïijŽ"However, the spatial and temporal ...". SuggestionïijŽPlease check this sentence, especially "monthly means".

Lines 50-51ïijŽ"resOlution"; "surface". SuggestionïijŽResolution; Surface.

Line 53ïijŽIs HOLAPS currently the only approach or datasets?

Line 63ïijŽ"highest and largest plateau in the world" SuggestionïijŽTP is the highest but not largest (area) plateau in the world. The largest plateau is Brazilian Plateau, which contains five million Km2. However, TP has three million Km2. Please revise it.

Line 74ïijŽ"situ" should be in italics "situ"

Line 90ïijŽPlease write the full name of WACMOS-ET When the first appeared in the manuscript.

Lines 99-100ïijŽ"These datasets are SEBSSRB-PU, PTSRB-PU and PMSRB-PU, which are respectively based on PM, PT, and SEBS algorithms" SuggestionïijŽ"These datasets are SEBSSRB-PU, PTSRB-PU and PMSRB-PU, which are respectively based on SEBS, PT and PM algorithms"

Line 116ïijŽ"be found in (Loew et al., 2015). " should be changed as "be found in the reference of Loew et al. (2015). "

Lines 164-165ïijŽ" all products capture well the seasonal variability with minimum LE in the summer and maximum LE in the winter. "SuggestionïijŽAccording to Figure 4, all products capture well the seasonal variability with minimum LE in the winter and

HESSD

Interactive comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



maximum LE in the summer. Also in abstract (lines 25-26).

Lines 204ïijŽ"ïijŽthe benchmark dataset (Figure 4)" SuggestionïijŽthe benchmark dataset (Figure 5)

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., doi:10.5194/hess-2015-551, 2016.

HESSD

Interactive comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

