

From: Luis Samaniego luis.samaniego@ufz.de
Subject: Re: Reply to the Editor (hess-2015-551)
Date: June 9, 2016 at 1:21 PM
To: Peng, Jian jian.peng@mpimet.mpg.de
Cc: editorial@copernicus.org, Alexander Loew alexander.loew@lmu.de

Dear Mr Peng,

My comment goes in direction on how to organise a research paper. Firstly, we expect for a research article in HESS a research hypothesis and related postulations based on a substantial review of current literature. The methods part should address how to falsify the null hypothesis associated with your postulations and then we expect a clear description of results followed by thorough discussion of results and conclusions and steps ahead. I am sorry but I do not see this in your paper. I have never seen a research article that starts with a figure of the case study in the introduction. Please ensure that the resubmission has this structure. I guess that you have the material to do it. I hope this help you to restructure your manuscript.

Kind regards

Luis Samaniego--
Dr. Luis Samaniego / Deputy Head
Department Computational Hydrosystems (CHS)

Helmholtz-Zentrum für Umweltforschung GmbH - UFZ
Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research - UFZ
Permoserstraße 15 / 04318 Leipzig / Germany
phone +49 341 235 1971 / fax +49 341 235 1939
luis.samaniego@ufz.de / www.ufz.de

Sitz der Gesellschaft: Leipzig
Registergericht: Amtsgericht Leipzig, Handelsregister Nr. B 4703
Vorsitzender des Aufsichtsrats: MinDirig Wilfried Kraus
Wissenschaftlicher Geschäftsführer: Prof. Dr. Georg Teutsch
Administrative Geschäftsführerin: Dr. Heike Graßmann

Stochastic Hydrology Group
www.ufz.de/index.php?en=13975
News: Editors' Choice Award 2010
www.agu.org/journals/wr/

From: Peng, Jian jian.peng@mpimet.mpg.de
Subject: Re: Reply to the Editor (hess-2015-551)
Date: June 29, 2016 at 5:56 PM
To: Luis Samaniego luis.samaniego@ufz.de
Cc: editorial@copernicus.org, Alexander Loew alexander.loew@lmu.de

Dear Dr. Samaniego,

Thank you very much for your reply, and clarification of your comments. We have restructured and revised our manuscript (please see attached file), including (1) clarifying the research questions in section 'Introduction' (2) moving the Figure 1 to section 'Study area' (3) Add two subsections 3.1 Data and 3.2 Methods, and add more description of the methods that are used for the analysis. (4) Rewrite the conclusion. Please find the revised manuscript in attached file, and the blue color texts are the revision parts.

We greatly appreciate your useful comments that help a lot to improve our manuscript. And we believe that the current manuscript is much improved and hope you agree.

Thank you again and look forward to your decision,
Jian on behalf of the co-authors

Dr. Jian Peng
University of Munich
Max Planck Institute for Meteorology
Luisenstr. 37 80333 Munich, Germany
Phone: +49 89 2180 6515
E-mail: jian.peng@mpimet.mpg.de

