Hydrology and Earth System Sciences Discussions

Interactive comment on "Drought risk assessments of water resources systems under climate change: a case study in Southern Taiwan" by T. C. Yang et al.

HHG Savenije (Editor)

h.h.g.savenije@tudelft.nl

Received and published: 25 January 2013

The paper deals with a consultancy-like case study. It makes use of a combination of methods that have been published and widely used elsewhere. It analysis the consequences of a range of climatic model forecasts on the water resources system linked to a reservoir in Taiwan.

From a scientific point of view, this paper does not offer much of interest to the hydrological community, for four reasons:

1. It is an application of a combination of well-known models and methodologies

2. Climate change impacts based on a combination of climatic model forecasts is not offering anything new to the hydrological community and is very speculative as different models have quite different outcomes.

3. The authors developed nothing new, besides the linear combination of a number of stress indicators, which is hardly an innovation.

4. The authors published most of this material before in 2004 in reviewed proceedings.

Although there is not much fault with the paper, the combination of these 4 points and particularly the latter is sufficient reason not to recommend publication in HESS. Probably a more engineering orientated journal would be more appropriate. In case the authors would like to submit the paper elsewhere, I recommend to write the equations (2) and (3) in regular and compatible units and to include the time step in (4). The units of hydrological fluxes (particularly rainfall and evaporation) are in L/T and not in L. The units in the graphs showing these fluxes need to be corrected accordingly.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 9, 12395, 2012.