Hydrology and Earth System Sciences Discussions

Interactive comment on "Short memory or long memory: an empirical survey of daily rainfall data" *by* F. Yusof and I. L. Kane

Anonymous Referee #2

The paper provides a way of estimating the origin of the breaks in a set of hydrometeorological time series of 34 years for Malaysia. In particular, whether the breaks is an effect of a long or short memory process. Although it is a very interesting and important subject, especially for the field of water management, the way the authors choose to present it minimizes the total effort. In light of this and in agreement with Reviewer #1, the paper should be oriented towards hydrometeorological time series with the appropriated literature review in the introduction. Also some inputs about autocorrelations should be admitted into the introduction and not in the results section (P12278 L22-P12279 L2). Technical Comments: The authors should explain in the methodology what is and at which point the used the CUSUM test. P12277 L6 the equation should be corrected with fu(w) P12278 L19: The figures should be mentioned in the correct

C6222

order. "Figure 2" is actually Figure 1. P12280 L18 "Figure 3" is actually "Figure 5".

In conclusion, the authors have to revise this paper having in mind that approach a hydrometeorological issue (introduction), correcting the methodology section and presenting the results in an appropriated order.