

Interactive comment on “Paleoclimatological perspective on the hydrometeorology of the Mekong Basin” by T. A. Räsänen et al.

M. Sivapalan (Editor)

sivapala@uiuc.edu

Received and published: 8 January 2013

The discussion paper has received comments from three reviewers, all of which have been constructive, although one must note that Reviewer #3 has raised serious concerns about the novelty and contributions of the paper.

First of all, this is a discussion journal and it is incumbent on the authors to post their responses to the reviewers separately in case the reviewers want to respond again. This is important for the quality of the paper, and will be weighed carefully in any decision to proceed to publication in HESS.

I would like to see a careful and considered response to Reviewer #3, who questions

C6172

the novelty of the paper (methods used are standard), and also the strength of the contributions to the literature. The question in the reviewer's mind (and in my mind) is what has been learned from this study that is transferable to some other place. Just to say that hydrologic variability has increased in recent times in the Mekong without any attribution is a concern for the eventual publishability of the paper in HESS. I would like to hear from the authors how they intend to handle the revisions in a way to allay these concerns. I suspect that the paper has to undergo careful (and substantial) revisions. I am hoping that Reviewer #3 will respond again, and in this way strengthen the arguments for publication. I look forward to this discussion and a further evaluation.

Once I find the authors' responses I will again post a comment with recommendations for a revised manuscript (if appropriate).

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 9, 12729, 2012.

C6173