Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 9, C5298-C5299, 2012

www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/9/C5298/2012/ © Author(s) 2012. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



Interactive comment on "On-line multistep-ahead inundation depth forecasts by recurrent NARX networks" by H.-Y. Shen and L.-C. Chang

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 20 November 2012

This study presents a novel and useful approach for on-line multistep ahead inundation forecasts. The most important contribution of this study is the proposed R-NARX models can effectively inhibit error growth when being applied to multistep-ahead inundation forecasts over a long lasting forecast period. The models were trained and well validated using a great number of inundation data sets in Yilan County, Taiwan. The results demonstrate its capability and applicability for on-line multistep ahead forecasts of inundation depths during typhoon events. Overall, this manuscript is well written and is a very interesting work that successfully applies to on-line inundation forecasts. In my opinion, the manuscript has the merits to illustrate the potential of data driven methods to model a real hydrological systems and makes good contribution to scientific community. I highly recommend the acceptance for publication after minor edits C5298

shows as follows:

1. It is suggested to clear present the model used for on-line forecasting.

2. P.12003, n should be defined.

3. The standard back-propagation learning algorithm (P.12004, line10) and the on-line back-propagation learning algorithm (P.12005, line 11) are not clear to describe the differences between the learning algorithms of T-NARX and R-NARX.

4. P12021-12023 The caption of Figures 1 to 3 can be consider to change as Fig. 1. Architecture of the T-NARX network during training and testing phases in Time-delay mode. Fig. 2. Architecture of the O-NARX network during training and testing phases in On-line mode. Fig. 3. Architecture of the R-NARX network during training and testing phases in Recurrent mode.

5. It is suggested to re-plot Figure 4 to combine the rain guage and inundation-prone sites into one sub-figure and another sub-figure (side) can clear show (enlarge) the flood inundation map.

6. Figure 8 is not clear and the resolution should be improved.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 9, 11999, 2012.