Hydrology and Earth System Sciences Discussions

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on "Estimation of forest structure metrics relevant to hydrologic modeling using coordinate transformation of airborne laser scanning data" *by* A. Varhola et al.

W. Wagner (Editor)

ww@ipf.tuwien.ac.at

Received and published: 1 August 2012

I would like to thank the four reviewers for their careful and detailed review of this paper! They have identified many important issues, which will certainly help improving the paper. Similarly I thank the authors for addressing all comments with great care.

Personally, I tend to agree with a basic criticism of reviewer #4 "that transforming ALS data coordinates to mimic hemispherical photographs is the wrong way to go." Nevertheless, the approach presented by the authors is novel and innovative, and may lead to unexpected new approaches and insights.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

Some of the reviewers have also correctly noted that the impact of the new forest structure metrics on hydrological model performance is not being demonstrated, even though one might expect this already from the title of the paper "Estimation of forest structure metrics relevant to hydrologic modeling using coordinate transformation of airborne laser scanning data". Still, the paper is of relevance to HESS readers, and I would suggest revising the text in such as way as not to evoke such a wrong expectation.

The response of the authors was in my view by and large sufficient, and hence I invite the authors to submit a revised version of the paper. Some reviewers requested to see the paper again and hence the revised paper will undergo a second review.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 9, 5531, 2012.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper