

Interactive comment on “Spatial variability of herbicide mobilisation and transport at catchment scale: insights from a field experiment” by T. Doppler et al.

T. Doppler et al.

tobias.doppler@eawag.ch

Received and published: 12 March 2012

General answer to the review by Julian Klaus

We would like to thank Julian Klaus for the detailed and constructive review that will help to significantly increase the manuscript quality. We will now give a general answer to the main concerns raised in the review and answer the detailed comments in a second step, after having received the other review(s).

Reviewer comment: The necessary improvements are related to clear objectives/hypotheses, needed citations, structure, and language/style. I highly recommend that a native speaker improves the language throughout the manuscript. A serious

C298

problem in the manuscript is the structure of the different sections. E.g. methods are reoccurring in the result section while discussion is occurring in both, the results and the conclusion. A more consistent structure with a more precise story line linked to clear expressed objectives will significantly improve the readability and impact of the work.

Answer: We will reformulate the objectives and hypothesis to make the goals of the study clearer. We will also make a clearer link to the conclusions. Where appropriate, we will restructure the paper according to the suggestions. Especially the sections on mobilisation and retention (sect. 3.2.2 and 3.2.3 on pages 2378 to 2380) will certainly profit from restructuring. We will also reformulate the section on the electrical conductivity of overland flow (pages 2374 to 2375) to make our arguments clearer. During the restructuring of the manuscript we will put the emphasis on the readability. We argue that some overlap between results, discussion and conclusions improves the readability. We will give the revised manuscript to a native speaker for language correction.

Reviewer comment: Additional the discussion section is mainly based on work of the EAWAG group itself. I imagine that, at least for pesticide transport in infiltration excess overland flow, more work exists.

Answer: We do not know of catchment scale studies with controlled herbicide applications and spatially resolved sampling other than the Eawag studies cited. There are, however, studies on certain aspects that we will cite where appropriate.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 9, 2357, 2012.