



Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Estimation of overland flow metrics at semiarid condition: Patagonian Monte” by M. J. Rossi and J. O. Ares

S. Thompson (Editor)

sally.thompson@berkeley.edu

Received and published: 10 July 2012

The authors have now received detailed, critical feedback from two reviewers. The first reviewer highlighted significant issues around communication and confusion in the paper; the second author has raised serious concerns about the viability and validity of the methodology applied. If the authors can robustly and convincingly address the methodological concerns, particularly: - the validity and representativeness of the flow rates used experimentally - the defensibility of using the kinematic wave approximation in the context of steep slopes - the potential for spurious correlation

then I will consider a revised manuscript, although it would certainly be sent back for review. However, I must advise the authors that the case posed against the manuscript

C2860

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



is strong and that the chances of acceptance in the current phase are slender unless a very strong rebuttal can be made.

Yours truly

Sally Thompson

Interactive comment on *Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss.*, 9, 5837, 2012.

HESSD

9, C2860–C2861, 2012

Interactive
Comment

[Full Screen / Esc](#)

[Printer-friendly Version](#)

[Interactive Discussion](#)

[Discussion Paper](#)

