Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 9, C2168–C2169, 2012
www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/9/C2168/2012/

Hydrology and Earth System Sciences Discussions

Interactive comment on "Integration of SRTM and TRMM date into the GIS-based hydrological model for the purpose of flood modelling" *by* A. Akbari et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 12 June 2012

Akbari et al. utilized SRTM and TRMM data for flood modeling in the Klang watershed.

The exploitation of public domain satellite data for hydrological purposes is a useful and interesting matter and matches one of the goals of the HESS journal. Nevertheless, I think that this study presents many deficiencies.

By reading the paper I could not see a sensitivity analysis and therefore I could not establish the meaning of the fitting hydrographs in figures 7 and 8 ('right answers for the right reasons?'). The authors should make clear the research question and demonstrate that we have actually learned something useful (or interesting).

Secondly, most conclusions are general statements already not coming from this specific study (e.g. usefulness of SRTM-DEM for watershed delineation, limitation of TRMM data in capturing spatial and temporal rainfall patterns).

In contrast, other concluding remarks are not fully supported by the outcomes of this study and cannot be generalized (e.g. ”integrating TRMM and SRTM data give a reasonable estimation for volume of the floods in midsize watershed”).

Lastly, the English is really too poor.

For all these reasons, I recommend a major revision of the paper before submission to HESS.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 9, 4747, 2012.