

Interactive comment on “A pilot operational flood warning system in Andalusia (Spain): presentation and first results” by P.-A. Versini et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 31 January 2012

The submitted manuscript deal with an interesting issue, the implementation of an operational flood warning system and its performance evaluation. Even when the implementation is well explained through the text, in order to publish this manuscript I found two major weaknesses: The paper is an good hydrological engineering application, with the current state of the art, but it doesn't include any scientific advance, in fact, many of the implement approaches are not sophisticated (using SCS procedure in the infiltration process, evaluating soil wetness initial conditions, using result coming rational method as a reference, using manual calibration. . .). On the other hand, even when approaches are simples, the evaluation performance might be implemented over an extended hydrological record, and the warning system might be well evaluated. However, the calibration and performance analysis use a few data, so the significance

C5954

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



of results is an issue. More over, even when the manuscript refers to the advance of using weather radar rainfall, there are no example of its performance over the GFWS. This work looks as a preliminary results document, but because there is not novelty or advance technique in the implementation process, the value of the paper is only on the calibration and validation test, and this is poor in this version. My recommendation for authors is to improve the paper with further records, giving more time to the warning system to get new flood events, and including a detailed explanation on the calibration and validation processes.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 8, 10425, 2011.

HESD

8, C5954–C5955, 2012

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C5955

