

Interactive comment on “An algorithm for delineating and extracting hillslopes and hillslope width functions from gridded elevation data” by P. Noel et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 21 November 2011

This paper aims at presenting a method for the delineation of hillslopes and the computation of hillslope width functions from topographic data. There are several edits/comments I could make, but the main one is that the method proposed is not presented in sufficient details. The paper lacks references to all the body of literature on the subject: hillslope detection has been discussed quite a bit in the literature, but no comparison is done in this paper. Tarboton's Dinf method and Orlandini's papers are referenced, but not in the way I would have expected. Tarboton's 1997 papers describes in a very detailed way the Dinf method, why is needed, etc. and Orlandini's papers do the same, but these methods are not compared here to the one proposed.

C5019

The only method I see mentioned is the steepest descent, which is well known to fail in extracting hillslope paths appropriately. There may be good ideas in this paper, but there isn't enough information for assessing the quality of the method proposed. Substantial work in introduction, reference to previously proposed methods, description of what is new in the method proposed and comparison with existing methods should be done before this paper could be considered for publication on HESS.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 8, 8865, 2011.

C5020