Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 8, C4373-C4374, 2011

www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/8/C4373/2011/ © Author(s) 2011. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



Interactive comment on "Shallow rainwater lenses in deltaic areas with saline seepage" by P. G. B. de Louw et al.

M. Antonellini (Referee)

m.antonellini@unibo.it

Received and published: 11 October 2011

I find this an excellent manuscript and a great contribution to the hydrogeology literature. My following comments are just relative to the form. The paper is a bit too long in the presentation of the results, which makes it a little hard to read. The methods used and analysis done are sound and they show a very nice integration among different datasets.

A point that the authors should address is the apparent confusion between confining layer, aquitard and low permeability layer within the aquitard. Sometimes the authors refer to a confining layer but it is not clear if it is an acquiclude or an aquitard. Given that the concept of aquifer is a relative one, some better explanation (maybe only a C4373

better indexing of fig. 1 would suffice. (see pages 7678 lines 21-24)

Another point to address would be the fact if saline seepage in low-lying polders is only vertical or also lateral, this is not completely clear to me from the paper.

I would suggest to the authors to avoid some jargon as "salt loads", which is not clear to all hydrogeologists; also the extensive use of acronyms make the paper difficult to read.

Dispersivity values in the models seem to be very small to be realistic.

Some specific comments:

- p. 7672 line 23-26 Is this vertical seepage in the ditch that hinders the infiltration of fresh water or the difference in head? Not clear.
- p. 7661 peat cutting \rightarrow peat mining? dewatering of land by man \rightarrow land reclamation?
- p. 7662 line 4 subside \rightarrow sink p. 7665 extracted all the water \rightarrow flushed the water? p. 7669 line 5 year 30 \rightarrow 30 years p. 7680 lines 19-23 The sentence is not clear, a figure might better explain the processes that the authors would like to describe; the same for p. 7682 lines 3-10

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 8, 7657, 2011.