

## ***Interactive comment on “Modelling water provision as an ecosystem service in a large East African river basin” by B. Notter et al.***

**Anonymous Referee #1**

Received and published: 10 October 2011

The comment was uploaded in the form of a supplement:  
<http://www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/8/C4370/2011/hessd-8-C4370-2011-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 8, 7987, 2011.

C4370

#### Manuscript Evaluation Criteria

Principal Criteria	Excellent (1)	Good (2)	Fair (3)	Poor (4)
<b>Scientific Significance:</b> Does the manuscript represent a substantial contribution to scientific progress within the scope of Hydrology and Earth System Sciences (substantial new concepts, ideas, methods, or data)?	X			
<b>Scientific Quality:</b> Are the scientific approach and applied methods valid? Are the results discussed in an appropriate and balanced way (consideration of related work, including appropriate references)?	X			
<b>Presentation Quality:</b> Are the scientific results and conclusions presented in a clear, concise, and well-structured way (number and quality of figures/tables, appropriate use of English language)?		X		

#### Access Review, Peer-Review & Interactive Public Discussion (HESSD)

Manuscripts submitted to HESS at first undergo a rapid access review by the editor (initial manuscript evaluation), which is not meant to be a full scientific review but to identify and sort out manuscripts with obvious major deficiencies in view of the above principal evaluation criteria.

If they are not immediately rejected, they will be published on the Hydrology and Earth System Sciences Discussions (HESSD) website, the discussion forum of HESS, where they are subject to full peer-review and Interactive Public Discussion.

In the full review and interactive discussion the referees and other interested members of the scientific community are asked to take into account all of the following aspects:

- Does the paper address relevant scientific questions within the scope of HESS?
  - Study addresses questions of sustainable water allocation and consumption as relates to hydrology, so fits well in the scope of HESS
- Does the paper present novel concepts, ideas, tools, or data?
  - The paper introduces various novel ideas especially for dealing with data scarcity both in quality and quantity, e.g. the delineation of the watershed using a graduated system.
  - The adaptation of the swat model for dealing with uncertainty in inputs is also a welcome novel concept
- Are substantial conclusions reached? yes

**Fig. 1.**

C4371