

## ***Interactive comment on “Land classification based on hydrological landscape units” by S. Gharari et al.***

**S. Gharari et al.**

shervangharari@yahoo.com

Received and published: 10 August 2011

**Reply to Comment by A. D. Nobre**

**Reply to “Authorship and Credits”**

We appreciate the critical comment of A. Nobre on our paper, which gives us the opportunity to correct and clarify several important aspects of our paper. We are also grateful for the additional documentation provided by the reviewer on the HAND method which he developed.

The first thing that we want to clarify is that it was not at all our intention to present the

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



HAND methodology, which was introduced by Rennó et al. (2008) and by Nobre et al. (2011), as if it was our own idea. We regret that the reviewer had this impression, and we will make sure that in the final version sufficient credit is given to the developers of the approach. Although we also want to stress that we did make proper reference to the paper of Rennó et al. (2008) and of Nobre et al. (2011), even though the latter had not yet been published at the time of our submission to HESSD. Our original paper contained several references to the work of Nobre's group, including the latest Nobre et al. (2011) paper, which was published on 29 of June of 2011, almost 2 months after (!) we submitted our manuscript to HESSD. This paper was kindly provided to us by the author himself.

In the revised paper we shall draw a clearer line between our own developments and what was done before.

We also want to mention that several ideas and potential hydrological research directions based on the HAND algorithm were already provided by Savenije (2010), well before the Nobre et al. (2011) paper was published. In that paper considerable credit was given to Rennó et al. (2008) and Nobre et al. (2011) contribution was mentioned as supplement. Again we want to emphasise that it was never our intention to claim this important work as our own, and if this impression was given, then this was clearly a misunderstanding.

## References

Nobre, A. D., Cuartas, L. A., Hodnett, M., Rennó, C. D., Rodrigues, G., Silveira, A., Waterloo, M., and Saleska, S.: Height above the Nearest Drainage, a hydrologically relevant new terrain model, *Journal of Hydrology*, 404(1-2), 13–29, 2011.

Rennó, C. D., Nobre, A. D., Cuartas, L. A., Soares, J. V., Hodnett, M. G., Tomasella, J., and Waterloo, M. J.: HAND, a new terrain descriptor using SRTM-DEM: Mapping terra-firme rainforest environments in Amazonia, *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 112(9),

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)

3469–3481, 10.1016/j.rse.2008.03.018, 2008.

Savenije, H. H. G.: HESS Opinions “Topography driven conceptual modeling (FLEX-Topo)”, *Hydrology Earth System Sciences*, 14, 2681–2692, 10.5194/hess-14-2681-201, 2010.

---

Interactive comment on *Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss.*, 8, 4381, 2011.

**HESSD**

8, C3371–C3373, 2011

---

Interactive  
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C3373

