

Interactive comment on “Development of flood probability charts for urban drainage network in coastal areas through a simplified joint assessment approach” by R. Archetti et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 4 July 2011

I apologise for lateness of comments. I enjoyed the paper, which is relatively well written but I would not regard it as leading edge science. However I would not exclude it from being published.

1. Effectively this is a methodology which is based on assessment based on two critical durations. The results are therefore unsurprising as the accuracy of any storm event is a function of its characteristics for the two critical durations and its return period characteristics at other durations.
2. Making it a function of %age of manholes is a very coarse method of assessment.

C2578

This analysis had the opportunity to make it a more risk based approach by looking at flooding consequence.

3. Joint probability dependency between rainfall and sea level surge is not discussed.
4. Best practice has moved on from node flooding to 2D flood analysis and consequence analysis.

I apologise for the brevity of these remarks.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 8, 3793, 2011.

C2579