Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 8, C2308–C2309, 2011

www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/8/C2308/2011/ © Author(s) 2011. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



Interactive comment on "Prediction of future hydrological regimes in poorly gauged high altitude basins: the case study of the upper Indus, Pakistan" by D. Bocchiola et al.

A. Castellarin (Editor)

attilio.castellarin@unibo.it

Received and published: 21 June 2011

All Reviewers acknowledge that that this is an interesting paper that is relevant to the Special Issue on Catchment Classification and PUB, and I agree with this assessment. The study focuses on the prediction and analysis of future streamflows in the Shigar watershed at Shigar (size: $\sim\!7000$ square km), located in the the Hindu Kush, Karakoram and Himalaya region.

I believe that the Authors have adequately responded to the comments of the three Reviewers, and are encouraged to upload a revised manuscript for further consideration

C2308

of publication in HESS. Furthermore, I would like to encourage the authors to address some of the main comments of Reviewers #1 and #2 in more detail.

In particular

- 1) a common concern of both reviews seems to be the selected time resolution (i.e., daily). The reasons for this selection are clearly reported in the Authors' Reply and need to be clearly presented also in the revised manuscript. References to previous study supporting this choice should also be included in the text;
- 2) repeatability and reproducibility of the analysis is also a main concern. Although I perfectly understand the difficulties associated with the lack of data, I still believe that a (perhaps simplified) application of the proposed framework to another catchment in a neighboring region would tremendously enrich the paper, particularly in the PUB perspective.

Please, make each caption of Figures and Table as self-explaining as possible, specifically when acronyms are used (a common theme of all reviews).

I sincerely hope that that Authors will find reviewers' comments and suggestions useful while preparing the revised manuscript.

vvitn warm regard

VA CIL

Attilio Castellarin

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 8, 3743, 2011.