Hydrology and Earth System Sciences Discussions

Interactive comment on "Influences on flood frequency distributions in Irish river catchments" *by* S. Ahilan et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 14 June 2011

This paper deals with fitting of the GEV distribution to flood data and exploring natural factors influencing flood frequency distributions in Irish river catchments. The paper is well written and easy to read, although, I do agree with the comments and reservations posted by Reviewers 1 and 2. I only need to add the following extra (general) considerations:

- It is not clear to me what the innovative component of this research work is: I would suggest authors to state clearly what is new in this research that has not been done in previous works and how (if so) this approach can have a general validity.

- I find the paper a bit too long: paragraph 1, 2 and 3 could be re-worked and shortened to make them more compact. In particular, paragraph 3-methodology- does not need,

in my view, to provide such a detailed description of the GEV distribution. Proper references would serve as well.

- Authors blame climate change impacts (which to me is itself hard to define and identify) to be responsible for "intensifying hydrological cycle" and "are expected to result in greater flood risk". I must say that I find this statement a bit strong: detecting a trend does not mean climate change evidence. Furthermore, there is no comment on the issue of urbanization rate and its effect on the adverse effect of flood events.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper