

Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 8, C1965–C1966, 2011

www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/8/C1965/2011/

© Author(s) 2011. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



HESSD

8, C1965–C1966, 2011

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Insights from a joint analysis of Indian and Chinese monsoon rainfall data” by M. Zhou et al.

M. Sivapalan (Editor)

sivapala@uiuc.edu

Received and published: 4 June 2011

The paper has been well served by critical but constructive comments by the two reviewers. Clearly the paper will be publishable "eventually". However, the paper needs to undergo revisions - somewhere between moderate and major revisions. Apart from responding to all the detailed comments of the two reviewers, I would like the authors to seriously respond to the main concern of Reviewer #2 which is that he does not see (of the authors have not brought out) the novelty in the paper, beyond just agreeing with what has been already well known in the literature, in other words what is the new thing that this study has revealed.

I quote verbatim the appropriate comments of Reviewer #2: "At the moment it reads

C1965

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



something like “we did this and got these results and they agree with X and then we did this and got some more results and they agree with Y: : :.”. This is particularly the case in Section 3.1 and Section 4. Hence, I think it needs to be more clearly spelt out as to what in this paper is just supportive of previous work and what is actually a new and significant contribution?”

This does not mean that you have to necessarily do new analysis, but rather the authors should dig deep and extract more from the analysis results that is transferable to the other situations.

I would like to see the revised version of the manuscript - and under normal circumstances I would send it back to the two reviewers to assess the adequacy of the revisions. I look forward to seeing the revised manuscript, and hope that it will be published in HESS soon after

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 8, 3167, 2011.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

