Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 7, C3830-C3831, 2010

www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/7/C3830/2010/ © Author(s) 2010. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



Interactive comment on "Changes in streamflow and sediment discharge and the response to human activities in the middle reaches of the Yellow River" by P. Gao et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 2 December 2010

General comments: the work doesn't represent a substantial contribution in term of new concepts or methods, it is a simply application of a well known method. However the case study is very interesting.

Scientific Quality: The scientific approach applied is valid and clearly explained. Presentation Quality: it could be improved.

Specific comments: In the abstract there is a repetition of the three objective of the study (a),(b) and (c), presented in the introduction too. Maybe in the abstract the author can explain the objective of the study in a concise way, but less schematic and without

C3830

this repetition. P.6796 line 25: it could be better to explain in which way data have been controlled for quality. At par 3.3 In this introductive section it could be better to explain the theory that is on the basis of double mass curves and the reason why are presented in the study. P. 6799 line 6: "decrease coefficient of" P. 6081 line 12: "at the end of the section below", maybe it's better to specify the section involved P. 6801 line 14; "It is possible to calculate" P. 6803 line 15 "Impact of projects for water control" P. 6803 line 15-16 "Adoption of large/medium.." Fig.2 It could be better to specify what are the black arrows in the caption of the figure

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 7, 6793, 2010.