

***Interactive comment on “Hydrologic response of a semi-arid watershed to spatial and temporal characteristics of convective rain cells” by H. Yakir and E. Morin***

**Anonymous Referee #1**

Received and published: 16 November 2010

The authors work on the sensitivity of the runoff to the characteristics of the cells certainly makes a strong case for the need for radar data, or at least a dense network of raingauges (supporting previous work by Bardossy on German data for instance). A couple of comments:

1. The proposed method appears fairly simple to use, although all the details of the method are not spelled out. The worry is that the technique which is used to track the cells is not disclosed. I assume it is therefore heuristic (p.7733). Can anything more be said about this? It would be interesting to have the authors' opinion as to whether this

C3470

can be made automatic (using an Artificial Neural Network for instance).

2. Also note, when comparing different cell-based rainfall models, that a difference should be made as to whether the model cells are designed to represent physical cells directly or not. The Northrop, and Cox & Isham models, for instance, can indeed be described as having constant intensity over a certain area and for a certain duration (both random), but, unlike the other models listed here, there is cell superposition, so the total precipitation over that area and during that duration will often be the compounded effect of a number of cells (which leads to a noisier profile than the constant intensity of the cell suggests).

---

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 7, 7725, 2010.

C3471