

Interactive comment on “Irrigation enhances precipitation at the mountains downwind” by J. Jódar et al.

R.W.A. Hutjes (Referee)

ronald.hutjes@wur.nl

Received and published: 5 August 2010

Scientific Significance: Good The paper presents novel data and analysis that adds to the very scarce observational evidence of irrigation induced rainfall enhancements

Scientific Quality: Good The methods used are mostly sound though some methodological issues can be improved or at least be better explained (e.g. criterion for classification of stations - comment 3 below) and some conclusions need better substantiation (e.g. contribution of small vs large evens to observed trends – comment 8 below).

Presentation Quality: Good The paper is concise and to the point, English is mostly good and also figures and table are of good quality. Abstract covers all relevant results

C1711

and conclusions, though it remains qualitative where some quantitative details could also be mentioned. Some relevant details of the analysis are missing (e.g. significance level used in the tests; comments 4/5 below).

see attached supplement for specific and technical comments

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/7/C1711/2010/hessd-7-C1711-2010-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 7, 3109, 2010.

C1712