

Interactive comment on “A past discharge assimilation system for ensemble streamflow forecasts over France – Part 2: Impact on the ensemble streamflow forecasts” by G. Thirel et al.

F Pappenberger (Editor)

florian.pappenberger@ecmwf.int

Received and published: 4 August 2010

I thank all reviewers for their valuable constructive comments on this paper.

Similar to its companion paper, this paper has received mainly positive comments with requests for minor changes. The authors have responded to the comments well. Thus the paper can be accepted into HESS subject to minor revisions.

Formal Manuscript Rating and Recommendation

1) Scientific Significance

Does the manuscript represent a substantial contribution to scientific progress within the scope of this journal (substantial new concepts, ideas, methods, or data)?

1xExcellent 3xGood 0xFair 0xPoor

2) Scientific Quality

Are the scientific approach and applied methods valid? Are the results discussed in an appropriate and balanced way (consideration of related work, including appropriate references)?

1xExcellent 3xGood 0xFair 0xPoor

3) Presentation Quality Are the scientific results and conclusions presented in a clear, concise, and well structured way (number and quality of figures/tables, appropriate use of English language)?

0xExcellent 4xGood 0xFair 0xPoor

For final publication, the manuscript should be 0x accepted as is 1x accepted subject to technical corrections 3x accepted subject to minor revisions

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 7, 2455, 2010.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

