Hydrology and Earth System Sciences Discussions

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on "A past discharges assimilation system for ensemble streamflow forecasts over France – Part 1: Description and validation of the assimilation system" *by* G. Thirel et al.

F Pappenberger (Editor)

florian.pappenberger@ecmwf.int

Received and published: 4 August 2010

I thank all reviewers for their valuable constructive comments on this paper.

The paper has received mainly positive comments with requests for minor changes. The authors have responded to the comments well. Thus the paper can be accepted into HESS subject to minor revisions.

Formal Manuscript Rating and Recommendation

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

1) Scientific Significance

Does the manuscript represent a substantial contribution to scientific progress within the scope of this journal (substantial new concepts, ideas, methods, or data)?

1xExcellent 2xGood 0xFair 0xPoor

2) Scientific Quality

Are the scientific approach and applied methods valid? Are the results discussed in an appropriate and balanced way (consideration of related work, including appropriate references)?

1xExcellent 2xGood 0xFair 0xPoor

3) Presentation Quality Are the scientific results and conclusions presented in a clear, concise, and well structured way (number and quality of figures/tables, appropriate use of English language)?

1xExcellent 2xGood 0xFair 0xPoor

For final publication, the manuscript should be 1x accepted as is 0x accepted subject to technical corrections 2x accepted subject to minor revisions

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 7, 2413, 2010.