

Interactive comment on “Performance analysis of the proposed Reservoir Project in the State of West Bengal” by D. Roy and D. Banerjee

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 9 June 2010

The paper provides a reasonably clear description of the use of synthetic hydrology to examine reservoir performance with respect to water supply and flood control. But I find not much new in it that would justify publication in a research journal. Some of the terms (and parameter values) in various equations, especially in section 4.10, are not well defined, or are taken from the literature where it may be questionable if they apply to the particular river basin in India. I concur with the first reviewer's comments with respect to the need for some editing and the clarity of figures as well. I would have liked to see all the RI performance criteria defined mathematically to be sure I understand them. Also, I wonder why in Eq. 3 the flow in the previous month in the previous year is used instead of the flow in the previous month (lag of one month, not of 13 months). And finally, to repeat the comment of the first reviewer, it would have

C1091

been interesting to have had the authors at least comment on how this study would be modified to account for the uncertainty of future inflow distributions and their statistics due to climate change.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 7, 1373, 2010.