Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 6, C909–C910, 2009
www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/6/C909/2009/

Hydrology and Earth System Sciences Discussions

Interactive comment on "Evaluation of a probabilistic hydrometeorological forecast system" *by* S. Jaun and B. Ahrens

FP Pappenberger (Editor)

florian.pappenberger@ecmwf.int

Received and published: 26 May 2009

All referees agreed that the paper is a valuable contribution and the manuscript is of high scientific quality. The usage of NWP EPS in hydrological forecasting is still in its infancy and less than 4 studies exist (up to date) which evaluate the long term performance of such systems. This makes this contribution a 'must read' for all scientists interested in hydrological applications of NWP predictions. In addition, the authors also suggested a much needed method to benchmark the performance of such forecast systems. The criticism of the referees centered around the performance measures used as well as probed the issue of catchment response time versus the value of EPS. Both questions will undoubtedly arise in future publications to this topic and the response by the authors will give guidance in future discussions.

The referees rated the manuscript as follows:

1) Scientific Significance Does the manuscript represent a substantial contribution to scientific progress within the scope of this journal (substantial new concepts, ideas, methods, or data)?

1x Excellent 2x Good 0xFair 0xPoor

2) Scientific Quality Are the scientific approach and applied methods valid? Are the results discussed in an appropriate and balanced way (consideration of related work, including appropriate references)? 1x Excellent 2x Good 0xFair 0xPoor

3) Presentation Quality Are the scientific results and conclusions presented in a clear, concise, and well structured way (number and quality of figures/tables, appropriate use of English language)? 1x Excellent 2x Good 0xFair 0xPoor

All referees suggested that the manuscript can be accepted subject to minor revisions.

I thank the referees for their valuable time to review this manuscript and the authors for considering HESSD for their publication.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 6, 1843, 2009.