

Interactive comment on “A dynamic rating curve approach to indirect discharge measurement” by F. Dottori et al.

FP Pappenberger (Editor)

florian.pappenberger@ecmwf.int

Received and published: 27 April 2009

This article attracted an extended and exciting discussion. All reviewers agreed, that is 'a good idea' (John Fenton), is a 'timely and important contribution' (Thomas Clarke) and that it is 'engaging' (Geoff Pegram). The reviewers provided an in depth analysis of the paper and the authors responded to all comments. The authors also submitted a corrected version to the online discussion of HESSD.

The paper has been rated by the reviewers as follows: 1) Scientific Significance Does the manuscript represent a substantial contribution to scientific progress within the scope of this journal (substantial new concepts, ideas, methods, or data)?

3xGood

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



2) Scientific Quality Are the scientific approach and applied methods valid? Are the results discussed in an appropriate and balanced way (consideration of related work, including appropriate references)?

1xExcellent, 1xGood, 1xFair

3) Presentation Quality Are the scientific results and conclusions presented in a clear, concise, and well structured way (number and quality of figures/tables, appropriate use of English language)?

3xGood

Categories: Excellent, Good, Fair and Poor

Further, the reviewers suggest on average, medium revisions, which is also reflected in their comments.

At this stage, I have not evaluated the revised paper as this is part of the HESS publication procedure (however, I applaud the authors for publishing a revised paper for discussion!).

I thank the authors for considering HESS as their journal of choice and I am particularly grateful to the reviewers.

regards florian pappenberger

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 6, 859, 2009.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

