Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 6, C3272–C3273, 2010
www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/6/C3272/2010/

Hydrology and Earth System Sciences Discussions

Interactive comment on "Uncertainty in acquiring elemental fluxes from subtropical mountainous rivers" *by* T. Y. Lee et al.

A. Butturini (Editor)

abutturini@ub.edu

Received and published: 2 February 2010

Dear author,

The reviewers have evaluated in depth your manuscript. Both produced qualified comments. However, I regret that they found very serious conceptual limitations in your manuscript. On the basis of these comments, I cannot recommend your manuscript for publication in Hydrology Earth System Science journal. I strongly believe that your manuscript does contain very interesting and a unique data set. Focusing on the topic of the strategies for determining sampling requirements, I would suggest to you to analyse in detail comments posted by referee #2. I think that their comments might help to you to readdress the manuscript. O the other hand, and beyond the issue of estimating

elemental fluxes, I found extremely interesting the variability of solute vs. discharge dispersion plots (see fig. 4). Analysis of this response variability is rather unusual and it might improve our knowledge of biogeochemical responses in streams under storms conditions.

I know this news must be disappointing, but I hope that comments from reviews will help to you to improve your manuscript. In any case, if you consider re-submitting a totally new manuscript to HESSD, the paper would be treated as an entirely new submission subjected to new reviewers.

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal and I look forward to working with you in the future.

With kind regards,

Andrea Butturini Editor Hydrology Earth System Science

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 6, 7349, 2009.