

Interactive comment on “Recent floods in the Middle Ebro River, Spain: hydrometeorological aspects and floodplain management” by S. Domenech et al.

R. Merz (Editor)

merz@hydro.tuwien.ac.at

Received and published: 18 November 2009

First of all, I want to thank to the reviewers for their detailed comments and clear statements on the manuscript.

The paper was reviewed by three independent reviewers and who provided a generally negative opinion. In fact, all the reviewers do not recommend the publication in HESS in its present form and they concluded that a large amount of additional work is needed to improve the paper. In detail, reviewer #1 stated that ‘the manuscript presents many weaknesses ...’. Reviewer # 2 claimed that ‘the aim of the authors is beyond the pro-

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



posed methodology, data availability ...' and reviewer #3 found the paper 'very weak'. Nevertheless, the reviewers provided a range of good comments which may help the authors to work on that contribution.

I believe that the topic of your study is interesting (as also stated by reviewer #1) and suitable for publication in HESS. However, in view of the review comments, I believe that the revisions needed for acceptance in HESS, will end in a paper which is significantly different to the recent paper in respect to the methodologies and data used and the way conclusions are drawn. Additionally the revision will definitely takes much longer than usually needed for revision.

Therefore I have to reject the paper for publication in HESS.

The referees made constructive suggestions what is needed for a valuable and sufficiently scientific contribution that would warrant consideration for a publication on HESS.

PS: After contacting potential reviewers, an additional reviewer comment is not expected.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 6, 5937, 2009.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

