

Interactive comment on “Hierarchy theory in hydro pedology” by T. F. H. Allen et al.

M. Sivapalan

sivapala@uiuc.edu

Received and published: 5 April 2009

I read this paper with a lot of interest, thinking that it would assist me to deal with the complex issues that I face in dealing with hydro pedological research. However, I am very much disappointed.

The paper reads as a rather unstructured tutorial on the merits of hierarchy theory. Even on that narrow score of presenting what is hierarchy theory (as opposed to its merits) it fails to impress me, and I would not recommend publication in HESS.

Secondly, this is a paper that is supposed to discuss the potential application of hierarchy theory to hydro pedology. I am not sure if the authors even recognize what hydro pedology is and how hierarchy theory can assist its practice. The biggest problem with the paper is the lack of a concrete example, specifically from hydro pedology, to illustrate such an application. In the absence of this, I do not know how this paper

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



can contribute to this special issue.

I am prepared to believe that the authors are experts on hierarchy theory, but experts of hydrogeology they appear not. This kind of philosophical and non-technical presentation, without concrete examples, is not suitable for such a special issue. Therefore I am not able to support its publication in its present form in HESS.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 6, 2931, 2009.

HESSD

6, C210–C211, 2009

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

