

Interactive comment on “Hierarchy theory in hydrogeology” by T. F. H. Allen et al.

M. Sivapalan

sivapala@uiuc.edu

Received and published: 5 April 2009

I read this paper with a lot of interest, thinking that it would assist me to deal with the complex issues that I face in dealing with hydrogeological research. However, I am very much disappointed.

The paper reads as a rather unstructured tutorial on the merits of hierarchy theory. Even on that narrow score of presenting what is hierarchy theory (as opposed to its merits) it fails to impress me, and I would not recommend publication in HESS.

Secondly, this is a paper that is supposed to discuss the potential application of hierarchy theory to hydrogeology. I am not sure if the authors even recognize what hydrogeology is and how hierarchy theory can assist its practice. The biggest problem with the paper is the lack of a concrete example, specifically from hydrogeology, to illustrate such an application. In the absence of this, I do not know how this paper

C210

can contribute to this special issue.

I am prepared to believe that the authors are experts on hierarchy theory, but experts of hydrogeology they appear not. This kind of philosophical and non-technical presentation, without concrete examples, is not suitable for such a special issue. Therefore I am not able to support its publication in its present form in HESS.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 6, 2931, 2009.