Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 6, C1672-C1673, 2009

www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/6/C1672/2009/ © Author(s) 2009. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



Interactive comment on "The turbidity behavior in an Amazon floodplain" *by* E. Alcântara et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 28 July 2009

I have read through the paper entitled "The turbidity behavior in an Amazon floodplain" by Alcantra et al. In general the paper presents some interesting data and demonstrates some appropriate use of signal processing techniques, and the study is therefore ultimately suitable for publication. However, despite the strength of the study in this regard two main factors need to be addressed.

First, the structure the paper could be improved and I found intro and background sections to lack focus relevant to the scientific aims of the paper. In fact, the paper would benefit from a stronger statement of the scientific hypothesis and then the supporting information should be relevant to that. Some parts are also probably un-necessary and this first part of the paper could be reduced in size. As a result of this lack of focus in the front, the lumping of results and discussions and then the brief conclusions also could be strengthened to help communicate the underlying findings. The ordering of

C1672

the figures also needs revisiting.

Second, the english needs to be reviewed considerably as there remains some awkward grammar and missing words etc, right throughout the manuscript.

I think by addressing these issues, and supplementing the strong methodological content of the paper with improved logic and scientific basis, then the paper would make a worthwhile contribution to HESS.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 6, 3947, 2009.